

Annual Data Collection Report 2007

October 2007

FRA

Data Collection Report 2007

GREECE



Miltos Pavlou (ed.)
Yannis Ktistakis
George Mavrommatis

October 2007

Edited by

Miltos Pavlou

Authors

**Miltos Pavlou
Yannis Ktistakis
George Mavrommatis**

English editor-curator

Maja Zilih

Peer reviewers

**Dimitris Christopoulos
Chryssi Hatzi
Kostantinos Tsitselikis
Kostis Papaioannou
Virginia Mantouvalou
Fylío Katsavounidou
Athanasios Marvakis**

Foreword

- [1]. The RAXEN Data Collection Report 2007 for Greece has been produced by the HLHR-KEMO RAXEN National Focal Point, for the European Union Fundamental Rights Agency of Vienna in October 2007 within the RAXEN 2007 project.

Contents

FOREWORD	4
CONTENTS	5
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	8
A. Legal Issues	13
A.1. Brief overview	13
A.2. New legislative provisions.....	13
A.2.1. Racial Equality Directive.....	13
A.2.2. New criminal legislation.....	14
A.3. Statistical data and tables.....	14
A.3.1. Cases related to racial or ethnic discrimination	14
A.3.2. Criminal law court case	15
A.4. Case law 15	
A.4.1. Important decisions - racial or ethnic discrimination.....	15
A.4.2. Important decisions – criminal law.....	22
A.5. Additional information	22
A.5.1. Evidence of serious delays.....	22
A.5.2. Transposition of Council Directive 2003/109/EC.....	23
A.6. Good practice	24
B. Racist violence and crime	25
B.1. New criminal legislation.....	25
B.2. Complaints mechanisms	25
B.3. Brief overview	26
B.4. Official data and information (criminal justice and government) 26	
B.4.1. Official criminal justice data.....	26
B.4.2. Categories of incidents and crimes	27
B.4.3. Anti-Semitic offences	27
B.4.4. Anti-Roma offences.....	28
B.5. Trends in racist violence and crime / religiously motivated	
violence and crime.....	28
B.6. Unofficial data and information	28
B.7. Good practice	38
C. Key areas of social life	42
C.1. Employment	42
C.1.1. New complaints and monitoring bodies – differentiated data	
.....	42
C.1.2. Racism and discrimination (incidents and practices).....	42
C.1.2.1. Brief overview.....	42
C.1.2.2. Statistical Data and tables on incidents of	
discrimination and racism	43
C.1.2.3. Exemplary cases.....	43
C.1.3. The situation of immigrants and minorities in employment	
44	

C.1.3.1.	Brief overview.....	44
C.1.3.2.	Statistical Data and tables on the situation of migrants and minorities.....	47
C.1.3.3.	Additional information.....	48
C.1.4.	Good practice.....	49
C.1.4.1.	Policy initiatives.....	49
C.1.4.2.	Practical initiatives by civil society and government.....	50
C.2.	Education.....	51
C.2.1.	New complaints and monitoring bodies – differentiated data.....	51
C.2.2.	Racism and discrimination (incidents and practices).....	51
C.2.2.1.	Brief overview.....	51
C.2.2.2.	Statistical data and tables on racist or religiously motivated incidents.....	52
C.2.2.3.	Exemplary cases of discrimination.....	52
C.2.3.	The situation of immigrants and minorities in education.....	53
C.2.3.1.	Brief overview.....	53
C.2.3.2.	Statistical data on participation and achievement in education.....	54
C.2.3.3.	Statistical data on segregation.....	54
C.2.3.4.	Statistical data on support measures for migrant and minority children.....	54
C.2.3.5.	Multicultural education and anti-racist education.....	55
C.2.3.6.	Support and involvement of parents and communities.....	57
C.2.3.7.	Religious symbols.....	57
C.2.4.	Good practice.....	58
C.2.4.1.	Policy initiatives.....	58
C.2.4.2.	Practical initiatives by civil society and government.....	59
C.3.	Housing.....	61
C.3.1.	New complaints and monitoring bodies – differentiated data.....	61
C.3.2.	Racism and discrimination (incidents and practices).....	61
C.3.2.1.	Brief overview.....	61
C.3.2.2.	Statistical data and tables on racist incidents.....	63
C.3.2.3.	Exemplary cases.....	63
C.3.2.4.	Legal restrictions to access to housing.....	64
C.3.3.	The situation of immigrants and minorities in housing.....	64
C.3.3.1.	Brief overview.....	64
C.3.3.2.	Statistical data and tables on the housing situation of migrants and minorities.....	65
C.3.3.3.	Segregation and neighbourhood integration.....	65
C.3.4.	Good practice.....	67
C.3.4.1.	Policy initiatives.....	67
C.3.4.2.	Practical initiatives by civil society and government.....	67
C.4.	Health and social care.....	68
C.4.1.	New complaints and monitoring bodies – differentiated data.....	68
C.4.2.	Racism and discrimination (incidents and practices).....	68
C.4.2.1.	Brief overview.....	68
C.4.2.2.	Statistical data and tables on racist incidents.....	69
C.4.2.3.	Exemplary cases.....	69

C.4.2.4.	Additional information.....	69
C.4.3.	The situation of immigrants and minorities in health	69
C.4.4.	Good practice.....	70
C.4.4.1.	Policy initiatives.....	70
C.4.4.2.	Practical initiatives by civil society and government.....	71
CONCLUSIONS.....		73
ANNEX 1 – POSITIVE INITIATIVES.....		74
ANNEX 2A – STATISTICS COURT/TRIBUNAL/SPECIAL BODY CASES AND DECISIONS ON ETHNIC DISCRIMINATION		87
SOURCE: THE GREEK OMBUDSMAN. ANNEX 2B – STATISTICS COURT CASES CRIMINAL LAW.....		88
ANNEX 2B – STATISTICS COURT CASES CRIMINAL LAW... ..		89
ANNEX 2C – COURT, SPECIALISED BODY OR TRIBUNAL DECISIONS.....		90
ANNEX 2D – CRIMINAL COURT CASES.....		103
ANNEX 4 – RACIST VIOLENCE AND CRIME		104
ANNEX 5 – EMPLOYMENT.....		105
ANNEX 6 - EDUCATION		109
ANNEX 7 - HOUSING.....		111
ANNEX 8 – HEALTH & SOCIAL CARE		112

Executive Summary

Increase of violent incidents and discrimination cases

General overview: a year of developments

- 2007 is a year of significant developments marked by the increase of occurrence and intensity of the cases of discrimination and racist violence, as well as by the increase of the amount of available data, almost exclusively coming from academic research and unofficial sources.
- The Ombudsman - one of the three existing Equality Bodies - reported an increase of discrimination cases ('almost doubled within a year'). A consistent number of complaints is judged unfounded due to the 'citizenship exemption' and in line with the existing legislation that prioritises Greek citizens in access to employment and various professions.
- Three trials of a far-right representative and of an extreme right wing newspaper on charges of violation of the anti-racist law (n.927/79) for anti-Semitism and hate-speech against Jews and Roma constitute a major landmark in the application of the relevant legislation in Greece.
- The long term residence status legislation is practically not implemented and no such permit has been issued to date. The conditions and requirements for submitting the application are demanding and generally discouraging: a high, non-refundable 900-Euro fee, low yearly quota of participants in lessons of Greek language and history (500-1000), free-of-charge mandatory classes that take place only in the morning hours of working days, and examinations.
- A considerable number of researches and surveys provide ground of assessment of discrimination perceptions, attitudes, reality, and the migration and anti-discrimination policies on an EU comparative level. Greece is often classified among the EU countries with the least favourable policies and with the most negative persisting attitudes about immigrants and minorities.
- On the other hand, a notable number of civil society activities and a national strategy plan for social inclusion mark the development of more concrete action-taking with respect to tackling social exclusion and discrimination of immigrants and minorities.

Legal issues: implementing anti-discrimination legislation

- The Greek Ombudsman has reported an increase of occurrence of discrimination cases (50 on all grounds, and 16 on the grounds of ethnic origin) and has adopted important decisions concerning the application of antidiscrimination legislation. On the contrary, national courts and the other two specialised equality bodies in Greece did not report any such relevant activity.
- For the first time courts deal with cases of anti-Semitism and hate speech, implementing the anti-racist law n.927/79. A lawyer and a newspaper are charged with having incited deeds and actions that could provoke discrimination, hatred and violence against groups of persons for their racial and ethnic origins, and with having expressed offensive ideas against Jews and Roma.
- In the four separate cases against Greece, the European Court of Human Rights has adopted important decisions regarding the police brutality against immigrants and Roma, and in one case regarding the minority rights, in particular the freedom of association.

Racist violence: an increasing trend

- An escalation of racist incidents in autumn 2007 against immigrants and minorities (see below) provoked the reaction of civil society organisations and general perplexity about the rise of racism and a change in nature of violent incidents. For the first time, disrespect of a Muslim improvised mosque by police officers is recorded, and a number of unprovoked blatantly racist violent incidents are reported by unofficial sources.
- A mobile telephone video showing torture and humiliating treatment of two immigrants arrested by police officers in the Omonia police station - central Athens - in 2006, triggered a public debate of a wide scope, and resulted in a general condemnation of police brutality and impunity.
- In early summer 2007, riots in Greek prisons have drawn the attention of the public and competent authorities, throwing spotlight on the allegedly inhumane prevailing conditions. The majority of inmates are third country nationals.
- The European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CPT), the European Parliament Committee on Civil Liberties, the Justice and Home Affairs and UNHCR-Greece emphasised the emergency of inhumane conditions in the holding facilities for third country nationals and refugees. Furthermore, the latter two have recommended immediate closure of the detention centre in Samos, an Aegean island.

- In parallel to the increasing aforementioned trend, there is also an increased mobilisation of the civil society in terms of participation in the protest marches against racism, as well as in targeted activities and initiatives that improve documenting and reporting discrimination and racist violence, along with good practices. The HLHR-KEMO online anti-discrimination forms represent the first in Greece effort of this kind to improve recording and reporting of racism and discrimination against immigrants and minorities.

Combating discrimination against immigrants and minorities

Employment: ethnic discrimination and a national strategy plan for social inclusion of migrants and minorities.

- An especially low number of discrimination cases in employment has reached the Greek Ombudsman, Equality Body for the public sector, and none have been reported by the equality body competent for the discrimination in employment in the private sector. (Labour Inspection Body).
- However, reports, surveys and researches, as well as civil society stakeholders and social partners report wage disparity, ethnic discrimination in employment and recruitment, as well as degrading or even slavery-like working conditions of migrant workers. The limited success, or even failure of the regularisation programs results in persistent informal labour without insurance of a large number of immigrant workers, as frequently emphasised by the aforementioned sources.
- A significant development is the increased awareness of trade unions, demonstrated in their effort to record, report and to encourage immigrants' participation and to offer them support in the workplace in particular and in the labour market in general.
- The National Strategy Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion 2006-2008 includes immigrants among the beneficiary vulnerable groups. However, the evaluation of the report by the European Commission stresses that 'despite the positive steps, social policy adjustments carried out so far have failed to address effectively the multidimensional problems and needs'.

Education: Existing tensions and ‘mainstreaming’ through Greek language

- According to the Ministry of Education, the central concept of integrating ethnic, cultural and religious minorities in education is “mainstreaming” by integrating them in the regular education system. To that effect, the competent state authorities focus on enhancing their Greek linguistic skills and offering support and assistance to their learning process.
- Despite the fact that one million migrants live in Greece, the state does not have a permanently functional institution for teaching Greek language to adult migrants. In a few cases where such centres or schools do operate (usually at the universities), the participation requires migrants to have a residence permit and to pay an inscription fee. The gap is frequently filled by civil society volunteers and NGOs who set up informal schools. However, their educational curriculum can not be used for applying for the long term residence, because the latter requires a specific – state provided - curriculum for Greek language learning and examination.
- A Roma-only school (allegedly a ghetto) in the Psari neighbourhood of Aspropyrgos - wider area of Athens complex - was burnt down after an arson attack during the Easter school holiday.
- The issue of the Muslim headscarf came up for the first time in public discussion. The Ministry of Education promptly rejected the possibility of its prohibition, and students are not restricted in any way regarding their religious symbols and appearance in schools. Nevertheless, the administration of some schools is allegedly advising the Muslim girls wearing headscarves not to participate in the school parades, part of the regular activities of the Greek schools.

Housing: Roma loan programs and evictions, and the threat of the housing segregation of immigrants

- Social inequalities in major urban complexes such as Athens have been accentuated by the inflow of immigrants and there is a visible threat of segregation in housing.
- Roma evictions and local tensions related to housing and settling conditions of Roma families are documented. Supranational and international human rights’ organisations call for the accountability of the government and local authorities in view of severe and ‘shocking’ violations of Roma rights.
- The Roma ‘loans for houses’ program are being implemented, albeit at a slow pace. Only a small proportion of the applications for housing loans has been approved and provided to the beneficiaries. According to the reformed legal framework, municipal councils are responsible for evaluating and

approving the individual requests. A change of procedural rules and adoption of an ongoing assessment of the implementation of the program, and a continuous evaluation of its impact aim to improve its efficiency and facilitate achievement of the objectives.

- However, according to the national strategy plan evaluation, this can hardly be considered a good practice, given the scarcity of evaluations of the impact of the implemented measures, and given that in reality a lot remains to be done.

Health and care: A wide range of civil society intervention and support, and an ambitious national strategy plan

- A number of researches and surveys indicate that immigrants have limited access to health services, and that they suffer severe psychological problems related to their immigrant status and living conditions.
- A comparative EU-level research found that in Greece, country with one-digit percentage of irregular immigrants - the relatively lowest among the survey's countries – there is a theoretical legal access to medical care, but the overwhelming majority - the highest in the EU - is unaware of its rights to health services such as a cost-free HIV test for instance.
- In Greece, access to medical care for irregular immigrants, a large percentage of third country nationals residing in Greece, is permitted only in emergency cases of immediate life risk.
- An Athens University research indicates that depression and stress symptoms along with other psychological disorders are on the rise among immigrants - particularly Albanians - in Greece.
- According to the findings of a research about the psychological adaptation of immigrant children - mostly bilingual and multilingual Albanians - the latter did not face any serious problems of sleep, fear or phobia from school.
- A notable amount of activities and synergies of NGO, public administration and civil society stakeholders provide health and social care to immigrants and minorities throughout Greece.
- In the context of the Integrated Action Plan on Roma, actions are taken to safeguard and promote health and social inclusion.

A. Legal Issues

A.1. Brief overview

- [1]. The European Court of Human Rights and the Greek Ombudsman have adopted important decisions concerning racist violence and the application of antidiscrimination legislation respectively. By contrast, the national courts and the other two specialised equality bodies in Greece have not taken any relevant action.
- [2]. On 27.06.2007 the European Commission sent a formal request to 14 Member States, Greece included, to fully implement EU rules banning discrimination on grounds of race and ethnic origin (2000/43/CE).¹ In case of Greece, the Commission referred to the concept of harassment as articulated in the anti-discrimination law (n.3304/2005).²

A.2. New legislative provisions

A.2.1. Racial Equality Directive

- [3]. There are no new legislative provisions regarding the transposition of the Racial Equality Directive, or new equality bodies.
- [4]. The Greek Ombudsman - equality body for the public sector - reported for the first year in its Annual Report 2006 (published in April 2007) on its new mandate on gender equality (law n. 3488/2006) with a specific focus on multiple discrimination.³
- [5]. The new licensing law n. 3592/2007 provides that in order to obtain a radio license one must fulfil various rigid requirements, such as a minimum deposit of 30.000-100.000€, 24-hour broadcasting, and having Greek as the main transmission language. According to the OSCE Representative on Freedom of

¹<http://europa.eu/rapid/pressReleasesAction.do?reference=IP/07/928&format=HTML&aged=0&language=EN&guiLanguage=en>

² In a relevant press release, HLHR-KEMO highlighted the main shortcomings of the transposition and the implementation problems of the legislation. HLHR-KEMO, Press release (05.07.2007), HLHR-KEMO on anti-discrimination law problems in Greece http://www.hlhr.gr/hlhr-kemo/docs/HLHR-KEMO_PR_05.07.2007.pdf

³ The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

the Media, Mr. Miklos Haraszti, this “endangers pluralism by putting a high threshold for minority, community or low-cost broadcasters”.⁴

A.2.2. New criminal legislation

- [6]. There are no new criminal legislative provisions in place.

A.3. Statistical data and tables

A.3.1. Cases related to racial or ethnic discrimination

- [7]. No statistical data from courts and tribunals is available. Nevertheless, according to its 2006 Report, fifty one (51) complaints were filed to the Greek Ombudsman by persons who considered themselves harmed by failure to apply the principle of equal treatment to them according to Law 3304/2005 **marking a notable increase since 2005 (22 cases)**. Eleven (11) of these fifty one complaints were related to discrimination on grounds of sex and were examined under the light of Law 3488/2006. Sixteen (16) of these fifty one were related to a racial or ethnic discrimination. With the exception of nine (9) complaints that were deemed unfounded or are still pending before a court of justice (2), the remaining ones are still under investigation as the public administration has not yet given its final response. It is worth noting that in seven (7) out of nine (9) complaints that were deemed unfounded according to Law 3304/2005, the GO intervened under its general jurisdiction according to Law 3094/2003. In ten (10) out of thirteen (13) cases, the result in the complaints that have been investigated by the GO and then closed, has been favourable for the complainant⁵.

- [8]. **The number of complaints under the Racial Equality Directive has doubled since the previous year (2005). In 2006, the Greek Ombudsman handled 22 complaints on discrimination on grounds of race or ethnic origin (2005: 10). The total amount of cases where racial or ethnic discrimination was established by the Ombudsman was eight (8). No sanctions were imposed, since the Ombudsman has no relevant competence under the anti-discrimination law. In seven (7) cases discrimination was not established, although all of them fall under the ‘citizenship exemption’ provided by art.3.2 of the Race and Equality**

4 OSCE Press release: *New radio licensing law in Greece restricts minority media, says OSCE media freedom watchdog*, available at: http://www.osce.org/fom/item_1_25793.html (27.07.2007). Similar reactions were observed from the Thrace Muslim minority representatives and the press.

5 The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

Directive. Four (4) of these were complaints on discrimination in employment (on a total of eight (8) cases regarding employment handled by the Ombudsman), two (2) concerned education and one (1) provision of services. Eight (8) out of nine (9) cases handled by the Ombudsman regarding discrimination in access to goods and services referred to the Roma housing, and all of them were still pending on 31.12.2006. (see table in Annex 2a)

A.3.2. Criminal law court case

- [9]. Two exemplary cases of anti-Semitic hate speech and one case of hate-speech against Roma are recorded by the prosecution service. They concern the lawyer Kostas Plevris and the newspaper “Eleftheros Kosmos”. The above have been referred to trial for having ‘incited deeds and actions that could provoke discrimination, hatred and violence against persons and groups of persons, solely because of their racial and ethnic origins, and expressed offensive ideas against a group of persons because of their racial and ethnic origin.’⁶ All three trials resulted from ex officio judicial investigations following complaint reports filed by Greek Helsinki Monitor, while Jewish organizations and the Anti-Nazi Initiative have joined the cases as civil claimants.⁷

A.4. Case law

A.4.1. Important decisions - racial or ethnic discrimination

- [10]. Following the complaint no. 3833/2006, the Greek Ombudsman, examined if ethnic origin should constitute a prerequisite for the exercise of the profession of a lawyer.⁸ In the case in question, foreign born Greek citizens, who acquired

⁶ The first trial, initially started on 11.09.2007, is rescheduled for 03.12..2007, while the 2nd trial - of the newspaper for having publicly expressed ideas that are offensive to Jews because of their ethnic origin and religion - is scheduled for 18.12.2007. The third trial of the newspaper concerning hate speech against Roma is tried on 15.11.2007.

⁷ GHM press release (29.09.2007), *Greece: Three trials of far right “Eleftheros Kosmos” for anti-Semitism and anti-Gypsyism on 15 November, 3 December and 18 December 2007*, <http://cm.greekhelsinki.gr/index.php?sec=194&cid=3182>

⁸ A female, foreign born, naturalized Greek citizen under her capacity as an assistant lawyer (trainee), asked the Ministry of Justice to confirm that the provision in the Greek Lawyers’ Code according to which ‘a foreign born person who has acquired the Greek citizenship through naturalization cannot be appointed as a lawyer until after five years have passed since his/her naturalization’ is no longer in force after the publication of Law 3304/2005. The Ministry responded that ‘the administrative courts of Greece are responsible to verify the constitutionality of legislation (...) according to our Department, the existing legal framework regarding the appointment of a foreign born person who has acquired the Greek citizenship through naturalization has not been suspended’. In the meantime, the local Bar Association received the complainant’s application to participate in the professional license

their citizenship through naturalization, are subjected to unfavourable treatment comparing to those who acquired their citizenship either by birth or as an offspring of a Greek male or female, or have been naturalised as expatriates - Greeks living abroad.⁹ The Ombudsman argued that the provision in question contradicts the principle of equal treatment and should be considered as *de jure* abolished without any prior judicial decision or legislative act for its abolishment. Instead of providing an answer, the responsible Department of the Ministry asked for an opinion from the Equal Treatment Committee which was in agreement with the findings of the GO; the complainant was appointed as a lawyer with a six month delay after her successful participation in the examination¹⁰.

- [11]. In the complaint no. 7500/2006, the Greek Ombudsman examined whether the ethnic origin should constitute a prerequisite for applying for a post of teaching staff.¹¹ The GO deemed this precondition questionable¹² and asked this case to

examination in May 2006; the examiners' board allowed her to participate and, since she passed, her name was included in the successful candidates list that was sent to the Ministry of Justice as required; then, the Ministry appointed all the persons on the list with the exception of the complainant. However, Law 3304/2005 forbids any direct or indirect discrimination on the grounds of racial or ethnic origin in employment and occupation, imposing the equal exercise of a right or the enjoyment of a legitimate good. The only exception allowed for is the discrimination on the grounds of citizenship, which is not the case when Greek citizens in their own country are not allowed to enjoy the same goods as their fellow citizens.

- 9 According to the Lawyers' Code, foreign born naturalised citizens are in an inferior position compared to naturalized expatriates or Greek born on the basis of their origin (foreign born). There seems to be no appropriate and necessary means or objective justification for this discrimination. The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.
- 10 The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.
- 11 A Greek naturalised citizen applied for employment at the Non Commissioned Officers School of the Hellenic Army as a member of the teaching staff with an hourly remuneration contract. She was disqualified on the basis of not being a Greek citizen by birth, a necessary precondition according to the post advertisement. The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.
- 12 for the following reasons: Rendering the lack of Greek ethnic origin (foreign born) which is presumed by the acquisition of the Greek citizenship through naturalisation a criterion for allowing different treatment regarding access to employment and occupation, contradicts the equality of Greek citizens proclaimed in the Constitution (Article 4, paragraph 1) on the one hand, and the special provisions of Law 3304/2005 on the other. Such discriminatory practice, however, can not be considered permissible due to the lack of Greek citizenship (Law 3304/2005, Article 4, paragraph 2) since in this case, it is a Greek citizen who is prevented from enjoying the same good her fellow citizens enjoy. Besides, the exemption due to citizenship does not allow for proportionate deductions or differentiations on the basis of foreign or non foreign origin of Greek citizens. Moreover, this case of discrimination does not seem to relate to a racial or ethnic characteristic that is critical to the exercise of the specific teaching activity that can be objectively justified by a legitimate aim through the use of appropriate and necessary means (Law 3304/2005, Article 5). The Greek Ombudsman,

be re-examined since by the date the Law comes into force any legislative or regulatory provision contrary to the principle of equal treatment is being abolished¹³.

- [12]. Following the complaint no. 19747/2005, the Greek Ombudsman examined the dismissal of an instructor because she did not hold the Greek citizenship.¹⁴ The investigation produced that the Greek citizenship is not a prerequisite for employment as a specialized associate member of staff (“scientific collaborator”) if there were no other Greek candidates for the post (violin instructor). The necessary qualifications for her employment had been checked at the time of application as well as of employment offer. The Ministry of Education concluded that the employment of associate members of staff is not governed by the provisions for employment of teaching staff.¹⁵ The complainant sought recourse against the aforementioned decision which led to the suspension of her dismissal by the Regional Directorate of Primary and Secondary Education of Peloponessus, Directorate of Arcadia. The final court decision is pending and thus the GO cannot proceed with the mediation procedure¹⁶.
- [13]. The Greek Ombudsman examined whether the special provisions for admission to higher education institutions are compatible with the antidiscrimination legislation.¹⁷ According to the legislation in force¹⁸ students of Greek origin studying in EU member states are exempt from the special provisions pertaining to the admission of EU citizens in higher education institutions and fall necessarily under the special provisions for expatriates. However, discrimination against EU citizens on the grounds of their Greek origin comes into conflict with the provisions of Law 3304/2005, since the aforementioned exemption constitutes a direct discrimination on the grounds of ethnic origin. According to the GO, this is why the above exemption should be deemed as abolished (Law 3304/2005, Article 26) as it contradicts the principle of equal treatment; and there should be a single arrangement for all EU students with no differentiation or reference to ethnic origin. The responsible Directorate of the

2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

13 The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

14 A female alien instructor working at an hourly remuneration at a Musical High School, who had been offered a post as having the necessary qualifications for it, was later dismissed for not holding the Greek citizenship. The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

15 This was the reason why the complainant was dismissed as it was concluded that she did not have the necessary qualification of Greek citizenship.

16 The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

17 Ombudsman complaints 16371/2005, 4539/2006, 5314/2006, 9444/2006.

18 Law 3404/2005, Article 13, paragraph 3, section A and relative ministerial decision n. F151/1704/B6/17.2.2006.

Ministry of Education supported the view that if such a thing is approved, the Cypriot students of Greek origin, when included in the special group of EU candidates for admission in higher education institutions, will be in a more advantageous position compared to the other EU candidates since, by token, their performance in the examination of Modern Greek is by far better than that of the candidates who do not speak Greek as their language of habitual use. The GO suggested that the EU candidate assessment system should be rationalised by establishing, for instance, a coefficient for the knowledge of the Greek language whether this is the language of habitual use of each candidate or not; nevertheless, the GO emphasized the need to refrain from any reference or taking into account the ethnic origin of EU candidates¹⁹.

- [14]. When the issue of the potential compulsory relocation of Roma from the settlement of Votanikos area (Athens) arose in the mass media and within the organizations engaged in the matter, the Greek Ombudsman visited the settlement and proceeded with a series of actions in order to mobilise the competent services.²⁰ The Ombudsman recommended that special care should be taken and a suitable plot of land with appropriate living conditions should be indicated for the possible relocation of the Roma. Then, the competent Region General Secretary should take a relevant decision in collaboration with the competent Directorate of the Ministry of the Interior (complaint no. 13986/2006)²¹.
- [15]. In two cases²², the Greek Ombudsman had the opportunity to examine the reactions of neighbours to the Roma settlements in Lefkada. In the first case, Roma settled permanently in their shafts on a plot of land owned by a Roma relative and lacking basic facilities such as toilets, drainage, and electricity supply.²³ The GO addressed the Municipality and the competent Departments of

19 The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

20 The aim of these actions was to ensure adequate living conditions for this vulnerable population, and to prevent the possibility of compulsory evacuation of this plot of land without the guarantees stemming from the Constitution and the legislation in force. Special care was taken so that no sanctions would be imposed for violation of the sanitary regulations as was suggested by the Prefecture of Athens and Piraeus, Directory for the Protection of the Environment. The reason for such a move was twofold: First, these sanctions would have been unsuitable and ineffective. Secondly, by neglecting to take into consideration the particularities of this population and the special conditions under which they live, they would have constituted negligence to handle dissimilar cases individually, contradicting the principle of equal treatment. The response of the Municipality of Athens was still pending when the Ombudsman's Annual report was published. The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

21 The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

22 Complaints nos. 13770/2006 & 2864/2006.

23 This caused inappropriate health conditions and infections, affecting the settlers as well as their neighbours. In addition, due to the lack of electricity supply, the Roma were obliged to use a generator for long hours causing noise that disturbed their neighbours. The Health

the Prefecture of Lefkada stressing the compelling need for improvement of the living conditions of Roma according to the legislation in force ‘for the settlement of wandering people’.²⁴ In the second case, residents of the Apolpaina hamlet in Lefkada filed a complaint to the GO for the settlement of Roma in makeshift shacks and other structures (tents, toilets built with cement blocks) within the restricted-build area of the Holy Temple of Panaghia Hodegetria, a listed historical monument itself, and for the poor sanitary conditions on this plot.²⁵ The GO undertook the role of the mediator with a double aim: to preserve the area of the historical monument, and to ensure that the local authorities offer to the Roma special support as a group facing social exclusion. To this effect the GO claimed specifically the positive action option that the new Municipal and Communal Code provides for²⁶.

- [16]. Another complaint concerning Roma²⁷ before the Greek Ombudsman was filed by a female citizen for the long delay of the competent Department of the Municipality of Zephyri to issue a payment receipt for the Real Estate Tax paid in order to use it in drafting a real estate sales contract wherein the buyer would be Roma. A respective complaint was also filed at the GO for a delay to issue a Real Estate Tax receipt from the Municipality of Ano Liossia, which also included the accusation that this constitutes common dilatory tactics on behalf of the Municipality, in order to discourage owners to sell their properties to Roma. Finally, the payment receipts were issued following intervention by the GO; however, due to the regular occurrence of similar complaints, the GO is examining the possibility of intervening on this issue in a comprehensive way²⁸.
- [17]. In the case of *Perlala vs. Greece* before the European Court of Human Rights, the applicant, an Albanian national living in Athens, suspected of having thrown Molotov cocktails during a demonstration against the Greek educational system in 1999, was prosecuted and was given a suspended sentence to imprisonment. The applicant appealed on points of law but the Court of Cassation dismissed his appeal in 2003 without examining the ground of appeal based on Article 6.

Division of the Prefecture of Lefkada visited and examined the settlement and made recommendations to the Roma living in the area without, however, having made any progress ever since. The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

²⁴ Ministerial decision B- 973/2003, amending the sanitary regulation A5/696/83.

²⁵ The competent Ephorate of Byzantine Antiquities of the Ministry of Culture, following an on spot investigation, recommended to the Mayor of Lefkada to remove the Roma from the site and to relocate them on a plot that is not in the vicinity of sites or buildings of archaeological interest. The Mayor of Lefkada refused to evacuate the site referring to the permanent nature of the settlement as well as the fact that the plot is owned by Roma. The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

²⁶ The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

²⁷ Complaints 1956/2006 & 11255/2006.

²⁸ The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

The applicant complained for unfair proceedings resulting in his conviction. The ECHR concluded, unanimously, that there had been a violation of Article 6 §§ 1 and 3 and awarded the applicant 6,000 € for non-pecuniary damage. The intolerance aspect of the case was not brought before the Court.²⁹.

- [18]. In its judgment in the case of *Zelilof vs. Greece* the European Court of Human Rights held unanimously that there had been a violation of Article 3 (prohibition of inhuman or degrading treatment) of the European Convention on Human Rights concerning the ill-treatment of the applicant by the police; and a violation of Article 3 in that the investigation into his ill-treatment was ineffective. The applicant was a Greek citizen of Russian-Pontian origin. The Court did not consider that it had been established beyond reasonable doubt that racist attitudes played a role in the applicant's treatment by the police. Accordingly, the complaint on the basis of Art.14 was rejected as manifestly ill-founded. The Court awarded the applicant the sum of 20,000 € for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage, as well as costs and expenses. This case was also examined by the Greek Ombudsman and included in its 2005 Special Report on the impunity of the police officers. The Ombudsman mediated for Zelilof to gain access to police inquiry documentation³⁰.
- [19]. According to the ECHR unanimous sentence in the case of *Karagiannopoulos vs. Greece*, Greece violated twice Article 2 (right to life) of the European Convention on Human Rights, on account of the Greek State's failure to protect the applicant's right to life; (a police officer shot the then 17-year old Rom Ioannis Karagiannopoulos who has since remained 100% invalid) and in its procedural part Convention on account of a breach by the Greek State of its duty to conduct an effective investigation into the circumstances of the incident that had put the applicant's life at risk, and must award the victim 120,000 euros for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage. The applicant alleged that one of the police officers who had taken part in the operation had stated before the criminal court that 'the majority of gypsies are criminals'. The Court considered that, while the statements made by a witness during the trial were clearly insulting for persons of Roma origin and were thus unacceptable, there had been no violation of Article 14 taken together with Article 2³¹.
- [20]. In the case of *Celniku vs. Greece*, the European Court of Human Rights held unanimously that there had been a violation of Article 2 (right to life) of the European Convention on Human Rights on account of shortcomings in the organisation of the police operation in which the applicants' brother died; a violation of Article 2 on account of shortcomings in the inquiry into the death of the applicants' brother. The Court did not consider it established 'beyond reasonable doubt' that the actions of the State agents in the instant case had been motivated by racial prejudice against persons of Albanian origin. It

29 ECHR/17721/04 (22.02.2007).

30 ECHR/17060/03 (03.05.2007).

31 ECHR/27850/03 (21.06.2007).

therefore declared the complaint under Article 14 inadmissible as being manifestly ill-founded. Under Article 41 (just satisfaction) of the Convention, the Court awarded the applicants jointly 4,010 euros (EUR) for pecuniary damage, EUR 20,000 for non-pecuniary damage and EUR 5,000 for costs and expenses. The ECHR case concerned the death of an Albanian immigrant during a police investigation by the gun of a police officer in 2001. It had been highlighted in the Amnesty International 2002 Annual Report and in the US State Dept. 2003 Human Rights Report³².

- [21]. In the case *Bekir-Ousta and Others v. Greece* concerning freedom of association, the Strasbourg court held unanimously that there had been a violation of Article 11 of the European Convention on Human Rights. In 1996, a Greek court rejected an application to have a non-profit association called the ‘Evros Prefecture Minority Youth Association’ registered, with the twofold argument. One, the Treaty of Lausanne recognised only a Muslim, and not a Turkish minority in Western Thrace, and two, the title of the association was confusing and was not aimed at serving the interests of the Muslim minority in Evros. The European Court of Human Rights observed, among other, that even assuming that the true aim of the association had been to promote the idea of an existing ethnic minority in Greece, that in itself does not amount to a threat to a democratic society.³³
- [22]. In its Concluding Comments for the sixth periodic report of Greece, the Committee for the Elimination on Discrimination against Women calls Greece to implement effective measures to eliminate discrimination against ethnic minority women, in particular Roma and Muslim women, and to enhance their enjoyment of human rights. The Committee requests Greece to provide, in its next report, information on the situation of women from ethnic minority groups, including with respect to access to education, employment and health care, and on the impact of measures taken to enhance such access and results achieved, as well as trends over time³⁴.
- [23]. The Council of State judged that local origin and religious beliefs do not constitute criteria for public sector recruitment, countering the presidential decree draft that concerns recruiting persons in the ‘Panhellenic Sacred Foundation of Evaggelistria of Tinos’³⁵.

32 ECHR/21449/04 (05.07.2007).

33 European Court for Human Rights (11.10.2007), <http://cmiskp.echr.coe.int/tkp197/viewbkm.asp?action=open&table=F69A27FD8FB86142BF01C1166DEA398649&key=65185&sessionId=2603488&skin=hudoc-en&attachment=true>

34 CEDAW, Concluding comments of the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women: Greece (02.02.2007), available at: <http://daccessdds.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N07/243/74/PDF/N0724374.pdf?OpenElement>.

35 Eleftherotipia (17.08.2007), available at: http://www.enet.gr/online/online_text/c=112,dt=17.08.2007,id=26095400.

- [24]. The Council of State judged also that the Greek origin is not a precondition for the flag-bearer of the Greek Air Force Academy. Nevertheless, the flag-bearer must have the Greek nationality³⁶.

A.4.2. Important decisions – criminal law

- [25]. The Thessalonica Court of Appeal confirmed first degree sentence (four times life imprisonment) to the murderer of the three Albanian workers in 1995 and 1996. No racist motivation has been taken into account³⁷.

A.5. Additional information

A.5.1. Evidence of serious delays

- [26]. In 2007, The Economic and Social Committee ('OKE') issued the Annual Report for the year 2006 about the application of the equal treatment principle in Greece, as provided by the art.18 of the anti-discrimination law n.3304/2005. In this report the OKE provides an overview of the operation of the various equality bodies in Greece. It is important to note that, for the second year, the Commission for Equal Treatment of the Ministry of Justice had not responded to its written requests for cooperation and exchange of views³⁸. Since nothing has changed over the last year, the OKE repeats all the recommendations of its previous -first- report³⁹. Among these, the OKE suggests conducting a wide range of public awareness programs, as well as seminars on language and legislation designed for immigrants and other groups vulnerable to discrimination. On the matter of equality bodies, the OKE recommends all competences for preserving and promoting the equality treatment under all fields to be assigned to the Ombudsman, the only body capable of guaranteeing independence and efficiency of operation⁴⁰. Finally, the OKE recommends that a special pluralist Committee should be founded in order to examine and

36 To Vima (19.10.2007), p. 17.

37 Eleftherotipia (23.05.07), available at:
http://www.enet.gr/online/online_text/c=112,dt=23.05.2007,id=798956.

38 Economic and Social Commission, *Annual Report 2006* on the application of the Equal Treatment Principle on Greece, p.11.

39 Economic and Social Commission, *Annual Report 2006* on the application of the Equal Treatment Principle on Greece, p.20.

40 Economic and Social Commission, *Annual Report 2006* on the application of the Equal Treatment Principle on Greece, p.21.

advocate the amendment of all existing law provisions in force that introduce discrimination on the grounds of ethnic origin, citizenship etc.⁴¹

- [27]. In a very critical opinion (13.4.2007), the Hellenic National Commission for Human Rights, independent organ founded in accordance with the Paris Principles, has expressed to the Economic and Social Committee, which has the task to promote equal treatment irrespective of racial or ethnic origin (article 18 of the law no. 3304/2005), the view that the Labour Inspection Body (one of the three specialised equality bodies in Greece) does not possess the necessary means (inspectors and premises) for its work and, consequently, the Greek antidiscrimination action is not efficient. Therefore, the overall efficiency of the Labour Inspection Body is criticised and not merely the delays in decision making.⁴²
- [28]. Following a parliamentary question, which provided that the Labour Inspection Service (one of the three specialised equality bodies in Greece) does not have the necessary means (inspectors and premises) for its work, the competent Minister of Employment and Social Protection said to the Parliament that the Labour Inspection Service has the competence to impose very drastic sanctions⁴³.

A.5.2. Transposition of Council Directive 2003/109/EC

- [29]. The Council Directive 2003/109/EC has been transposed into the Greek legal order through the law n.3386/2005 (art.67-69), the Presidential Decree n.150/2006, the Interior Ministry circular n.47/2006 regarding the implementation of the Presidential Decree n.150/2006 and the transposition of the Directive 2003/109/EC and the Joint Ministerial Decision n.16928/2007 regarding the certification procedures of knowledge of Greek language, culture and history in order to obtain long term residence status. However, until October 2007, no such residence permit has been issued.⁴⁴

41 Economic and Social Commission, *Annual Report 2006 on the application of the Equal Treatment Principle on Greece*, p.24.

42 Ethnos (02.05.2007), p. 25.

43 Greek Parliament, Official Records of Plenary (10.05.2007), available at: <http://www.parliament.gr/ergasies/showfile.asp?file=end070510.txt>.

44 According to the Ministry of Interior, this may be due to the fact that this is a new residence status and immigrants are cautious in applying for it. Therefore, according to the Interior Ministry's Immigration Directorate, more information about the advantages of long term residence status is needed, and the competent services are developing relevant actions, while verbal information questions by immigrants are increasingly answered. Official doc. n.19188/07/15.10.2007 addressed to HLHR-KEMO by the Interior Ministry Immigration Directorate.

- [30]. A major research project regarding a comparative study of the integration policies throughout EU - MIPEX (Migrant Integration Policy Index)⁴⁵ - has indicated that Greece is on the EU-25 average of the compared countries regarding long term residence status legislation. However, the study shows that eligibility conditions are less favourable and limiting access to the status: ‘The procedure (...) involves a mandatory course whose numbers are capped by a maximum quota (some 500 per year). Applicants must then pass a high-level test on Greek language, culture and history, involving written multiple-choice and open-ended questions. The test itself is free of charge, but the whole procedure costs 900 euros. Although the assessments do not take into account the abilities of the individual, migrants who have studied in Greece are exempt.’ ‘These conditions, along with those for family reunion, rank third from the bottom, just above AT and FR. Long term residents are partially secure in their status under the law.’
- [31]. The Hellenic League for Human Rights⁴⁶ (also MIPEX national associate partner) has indicated that the long term residence status is practically not implemented yet and the conditions for accessing the procedure (high non-refundable fees, quota for Greek language and history lessons with mandatory morning classes) are hefty and discouraging. Even in the best of cases that immigrants would opt for entering the procedure despite the high cost and conditions, only about half of a thousand of them would be able to obtain such status each year.

A.6. Good practice

- [32]. A new legislative provision amending the Municipal and Communal Code provides for the duty of the municipal authorities to plan and realize integration schemes for Roma people.⁴⁷
- [33]. There are no other new legislative innovative provisions or administrative regulations promoting equality.

45 www.integrationindex.eu. MIPEX is produced by a consortium of 25 organisations. Associate partners for Greece are the Hellenic League for Human Rights and the Greek Ombudsman. MIPEX is led by the British Council and Migration Policy Group (MPG). The MIPEX regarded the comparative analysis of 140 indicators of legislation and policy concerning the immigrants’ integration in six areas: access to the labour market, long term residence, family reunion, nationality, political participation, anti-discrimination.

46 www.hlhr.gr – Pavlou M.(2007), *MIPEX 2007 Presentation Results & Comments for Greece*, (16.10.2007), <http://www.hlhr.gr/hlhr-kemo/docs/Pavlou-mipex2007.ppt>. Gavos Thanasis, *Kathimerini.gr*, *Μ. Παύλου: Προβληματική η μεταναστευτική πολιτική στην Ελλάδα*, (21.10.2007) http://portal.kathimerini.gr/4dcgi/_w_articles_kathextra_8_21/10/2007_208815

47 Art.75, para.1.e.5., Law 3463/2006, Official Gazette A 114/08.06.2006) entered into force on 01.01.2007.

B. Racist violence and crime

B.1. New criminal legislation

[34]. There are no new criminal legislative provisions in place.

B.2. Complaints mechanisms

[35]. There is no specific complaint mechanism to register complaints about abuses of power related to racism and xenophobia perpetrated by the police or other State officials. However, victims may and do submit complaints to the Greek Ombudsman for police brutality, while the NGOs in the field of human rights often denounce violent incidents against immigrants and minorities.

[36]. In July 2004 the Greek Ombudsman issued a special report⁴⁸ describing its five-year experience in the investigation of offences against the constitutional rights of citizens by the police: police violence on the one hand and police impunity on the other. As the 2006 RAXEN Special Study reports ‘in a particular reference, the Greek Ombudsman stresses that certain population groups, such as foreigners, feel too insecure to submit a complaint, fearing the treatment of police authorities. This fear even extends to petitioning the Ombudsman on issues of police violence, fearing retaliatory actions by the police.’⁴⁹

[37]. Moreover, the RAXEN NFP, HLHR-KEMO has developed and made available on-line a form for recording violent incidents against immigrants and minorities, irrespective of whether the relevant complaint has been lodged. It is a victimisation survey form, available in Greek language, and elaborated on the basis of the minimum requirements for data requested for the RAXEN National Data Collection Report. The aim of this initiative is to raise the visibility of racist violence and improve the validity and credibility of reporting similar offences.

⁴⁸ The Greek Ombudsman, Human Rights Department (2004) ‘Πειθαρχική Διοικητική Διερεύνηση καταγγελιών σε βάρος αστυνομικών υπαλλήλων’, (*Disciplinary and Administrative investigation of complaints against police officers*). www.synigoros.gr/reports/astinomikoi.pdf

⁴⁹ Pavlou M. (2006), RAXEN Special Study, *Combating ethnic and racial discrimination and promoting equality: Trends and developments 2000-2005*, NFP Antigone, p.51.

B.3. Brief overview

- [38]. Official criminal justice data does not provide any information whatsoever for racially or religiously motivated crimes, since such data are not regularly collected or elaborated. Nevertheless, the trials of a far-right representative and of an extreme right wing newspaper, on charges of violating the anti-racist law (n.927/79) for anti-Semitism and hate-speech against Jews and Roma, constitute a major landmark in the application of the relevant legislation in Greece. All three trials resulted from ex officio judicial investigations following complaint reports filed by Greek Helsinki Monitor, while the Central Israelitic Council and the Anti-Nazi Initiative have joined the cases as civil claimants.⁵⁰ More information on these on-going court cases is available in Section A.3.2. of Legal Issues chapter above.

B.4. Official data and information (criminal justice and government)

B.4.1. Official criminal justice data

- [39]. There are no available official statistics on racist incidents and crimes recorded either by the public, or by the police. One case only is recorded by the prosecution service regarding hate speech against the Jews and a trial against a journalist-lawyer and an extreme right wing newspaper (see paragraph A.3.2 in Legal Issues chapter and section on anti-Semitism below). There has been no change in classification, reporting and investigating racially motivated crimes by the authorities. HLHR-KEMO RAXEN NFP requested detailed information from the Greek Police Chief and the competent services of Public Order ministry, especially with respect to the criminal investigation of the notorious torture case at the Omonia police station, that was recorded by a mobile phone and shown on YouTube. Nevertheless, no answer has been received. Instead, the competent services forwarded to HLHR-KEMO the Police Chief Circular Order n.7100/4/3/24.05.2006 that recommends that racist motivation is investigated in any crime involving victims and perpetrators of different racial, religious and social groups. No information has been disclosed about the effective application of such circular.⁵¹

50 GHM press release (29.09.2007), *Greece: Three trials of far right "Eleftheros Kosmos" for anti-Semitism and anti-Gypsyism on 15 November, 3 December and 18 December 2007*, <http://cm.greekhelsinki.gr/index.php?sec=194&cid=3182>

⁵¹ Official response n.7100/4/4-1ε/09.10.2007 by the Police Headquarters provided to HLHR-KEMO upon its 16.09.2007 request for data. It goes noted that the official document has been

- [40]. However in 2007, Greece was condemned by the Strasbourg European Court of Human Rights in four cases concerning police brutality and killings against immigrants and Roma all analytically presented in the ‘Legal issues’ section. In none of the above cases has the eventual racist motivation been investigated or ascertained.⁵²

B.4.2. Categories of incidents and crimes

- [41]. There are no available official statistics on racist incidents and crimes, therefore no categorisation is available either.

B.4.3. Anti-Semitic offences

- [42]. One exemplary case of anti-Semitic hate speech is recorded by the prosecution service. It concerns the lawyer Kostas Plevris and the newspaper ‘Eleftheros Kosmos’ charged and referred to trial before the 2nd Three-Member Misdemeanor Appeals Court of Athens, for violation of article 1 paragraph 1 and article 2 of the anti-racism law 927/79. They are charged with having ‘publicly, through the medium of the press, with intent and acting in concert, incited deeds and actions that could provoke discrimination, hatred and violence against persons and groups of persons, solely because of their racial and ethnic origins, and expressed offensive ideas against a group of persons because of their racial and ethnic origin and specifically against Jews in general; the first of them (Konstantinos Plevris) carried out these actions persistently.’⁵³ (see ‘Legal Issues’ Chapter, section A.3.2)
- [43]. No official data on offences against Muslims and/or Islamophobia are available and crimes are not categorised as such, therefore data on Islamophobic offences are not collected either. However, hate crimes against Muslims are reported by victims and unofficial sources, presented further below in section B.6.

received by HLHR-KEMO by e-mail on 22.11.2007, practically one month and a half after the date reported on the official scanned document.

52 Karagiannopoulos vs Greece (application No. 27850/03) judgement published on 21.06.2007, Celniku vs Greece (no 21449/04) judgement published on 05.07.2007, Zelilof vs Greece (appl.no. 17060/03) judgement published on 03.05.2007, and Perlala vs Greece (appl.no 17721/04) judgement published on 22.02.2007

53 The first trial, scheduled for the 05.09.2007 was postponed until 17.09.2007 and then again until 08.12.2007.

B.4.4. Anti-Roma offences

- [44]. According to official information provided to the Greek RAXEN NFP, no official data on offences against Roma are collected and no official data are collected on Roma as suspects or as offenders.
- [45]. However, one case of hate-speech against Roma is recorded by the prosecution service after an ex-officio investigation.⁵⁴ It concerns the newspaper “Eleftheros Kosmos”. The above have been referred to trial for having expressed offensive ideas against a group of persons because of their racial and ethnic origin.⁵⁵

B.5. Trends in racist violence and crime / religiously motivated violence and crime

- [46]. The lack of available official data does not allow any assessment or comment on trends of racist violence and crime in Greece. However, it is the first time that racially motivated offences are recorded and brought on trial ex officio by the prosecution service concerning the application of the anti-racist law (n.927/1979) and anti-Semitism (see above).
- [47]. Data collected by unofficial sources and reported in the RAXEN Annual Reports for Greece (2004-2006) provide ground for estimation on racist violence trends in Greece. Such data series have been published in the HLHR-KEMO Annual Report 2007⁵⁶. However, no official source has commented on any notable development with respect to racist violence and crime in Greece on the basis of the above, or any other data.

B.6. Unofficial data and information

- [48]. Since racist motivation is not investigated in practice, the complete absence of official data on racist violence makes it impossible to draw a clear pattern or a trend. However, the number of violent incidents against immigrants and minorities, as reported by the press and the competent non-governmental agencies, allow depicting a generic, albeit not entirely reliable, picture of the

54 Following complaint reports filed by Greek Helsinki Monitor GHM press release (29.09.2007), *Greece: Three trials of far right “Eleftheros Kosmos” for anti-Semitism and anti-Gypsyism on 15 November, 3 December and 18 December 2007*, <http://cm.greekhelsinki.gr/index.php?sec=194&cid=3182>

55 The trial of the newspaper concerning hate speech against Roma is tried on 15.11.2007.

56 HLHR-KEMO *Annual Report 2007*, Miltos Pavlou, *Racism and discrimination against immigrants and minorities in Greece: the state of play*, April 2007, <http://www.hlhr.gr/hlhr-kemo/docs/HLHR-KEMO%20AR2007.pdf>

situation in Greece over the last years. According to the HLHR-KEMO Annual Report 2007,⁵⁷ on the basis of data collected by unofficial sources, there is a steady linear increase of violent incidents against migrants and minorities. Although the number of serious incidents is low comparing to other European countries, in 2007 it is likely to double in relation to 2006, marking a net and steep increasing trend.⁵⁸

- [49]. An increasing number of press releases by NGOs, and their protest marches against racist violence - especially the cases perpetrated by the police officers - in various Greek cities indicate an increased sensibility of the civil society organisations to the alleged considerable and rising trend of violent incidents against immigrants and minorities⁵⁹.
- [50]. The European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CPT) report to the Government of Greece on the visit to Greece carried out in August - September 2005 and the government response have been published in the end of December 2006 upon request of the Greek government. As the CPT stresses: 'Regrettably, the findings of the CPT's delegation in the course of the 2005 visit highlighted that many of the above rights were not respected in practice and, moreover, that there continues to be a widespread use of violence by the police against persons deprived of their liberty.'⁶⁰

57 HLHR-KEMO *Annual Report 2007*, Miltos Pavlou, *Racism and discrimination against immigrants and minorities in Greece: the state of play*, April 2007, <http://www.hlhr.gr/hlhr-kemo/docs/HLHR-KEMO%20AR2007.pdf>

⁵⁸ The statistical table of relevant data is available in Annex 4.

59 www.diavatirio.net, HLHR-KEMO press release on the rise of racist violence in Greece (15.10.2007) www.hlhr.gr/press/10-2007-RAC-Attacks%20HLHR-%CA%C5%CC%CF.pdf

60 Various cases of ill-treatment of the third country nationals in police detention were mentioned, with a special emphasis on the Omonia Police station. The Committee also focused on the case of a man most likely of Chinese origin who was detained in the Ellinikon police station 'for almost a year and a half without being able to communicate with anyone'. The CPT underlined that he 'appeared to have developed symptoms of serious mental disorder (...) neglected by the staff', and that 'it was the detainees themselves who cared for him'. The CPT recommendations emphasised, among other, the need to obtain statistics regarding criminal and disciplinary sanctions against police officers concerning excessive or irregular use of force, as well as on the number of sworn administrative cases opened, and on the follow-up taken in respect to these cases. Moreover, the CPT called for the Greek authorities 'to strenuously reiterate the message of zero tolerance of ill-treatment of detained persons and to reinforce it with a statement at the appropriate political level' and to investigate allegations of ill-treatment thoroughly by imposing disciplinary and/or criminal sanctions upon the officers concerned where appropriate, as well as to establish an independent police inspectorate. Council of Europe, Report to the Government of Greece on the visit to Greece carried out by the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CPT) from 27 August to 9 September 2005, CPT/Inf (2006) 41 (20.12.2006), www.statewatch.org/news/2006/dec/coe-cpt-greece-report.pdf

- [51]. A major European-wide research⁶¹ about crime and safety published in 2007 on the basis of data collected in 2004, has reported that Greece is 2nd only to Belgium in EU reporting most attacks against immigrants ('hate crimes'). Greece has the lowest rates of hate crimes in general (1.6%), but victimisation of immigrants is most common in Belgium and Greece (15%). Furthermore, religion was positively related to victimisation and 18% of religious immigrants had experienced a 'hate crime' in 2004 in Greece.
- [52]. A January 2007 edition of the Eurobarometer⁶² on discrimination in the European Union received high media coverage in Greece (almost exclusively press) due to its findings on the opinion of Greek people about discrimination and about belonging to distinct ethnic and minority groups. Among other, the Eurobarometer highlighted that Greeks see discrimination based on ethnicity as more widespread (76%) than the EU average level does (64%). Controversially, 'compared to results for the EU, more Greeks believe that sufficient efforts are currently being made in their country to combat discrimination (56% of Greeks vs. 45% at EU level).⁶³ Moreover, belonging to a minority religion or ethnic group is considered by Greeks as less likely to lead to disadvantage than it is at EU level (seven percentage points lower). In general, the Eurobarometer notes that 'Greek respondents are considerably less likely to call for greater representation of ethnic minorities in the national parliament (23% of Greeks vs. 44% at EU level, a difference of 21 percentage points)'.
- [53]. The Greek National Commission for Human Rights (consultative body annexed to the Prime Minister) has issued a report on trafficking depicting the current situation in Greece and offering specific policy and legislation recommendations to face the phenomenon⁶⁴.

61 Jan van Dijk, Robert Manchin, John van Kesteren, Sami Nevala, Gergely Hideg (2005), The Burden of Crime in the EU, Research Report: *A Comparative Analysis of the European Crime and Safety Survey (EU ICS)*, Gallup Europe1; UNICRI, Italy, Gallup Hungary, the Max Planck Institute, Germany, CEPS/INSTEAD, Luxembourg and GeoX Ltd, www.gallup-europe.be/EUICS. Fieldwork in most countries was performed on May/June 2005. The national sub sample for Greece was 1216 persons, the capital city sub sample was 804 persons, for an overall of 2020 persons. The achieved response rate for Greece was 43.6%.

62 The Eurobarometer – Discrimination in the European Union' was published on January 2007. The data were elaborated in Autumn 2006. In Greece the number of interviews was 1,000, the fieldwork dates were 12.06.2006 – 08.07. 2006, the total number of interviews in the EU was 24,796 persons, and the fieldwork occurred between the 07.06.2006 and the 12.07.2006.

63 A significant minority of 43% of Greeks take the opposite view.' According to the Eurobarometer findings, the results are highly influenced and connected to the age of respondents: '66% of those aged 40-54 say that they are satisfied, 30 percentage points more than the 36% of the youngest age group who gave this opinion.' The Eurobarometer – Discrimination in the European Union' (January 2007)

64 http://www.nchr.gr/media/word/Apofasi_trafficking.doc

- [54]. Amnesty International published its 2006 Annual Report containing information on violent incidents against immigrants, asylum seekers and minorities in Greece during the past year.⁶⁵
- [55]. The Annual Report 2007 of the HLHR-KEMO National Focal Point on Racism and Xenophobia⁶⁶ focused on recent developments and trends regarding racism and discrimination practices against immigrants and minorities in Greece. The report findings received public attention, especially in the national press media. The report criticises the judicial system in dealing with cases of racism and discrimination, as well as the level of accountability of major political actors who show attitudes and use wording that reflect or incite racism and discrimination.
- [56]. The ENAR shadow report for 2006, published in 2007, concludes reconfirming the HLHR-KEMO Annual Report 2007 findings: “while on the one hand, some significant steps were taken by the Greek government and a major shift in public debate has taken place, especially as far as integration of immigrants and religious freedom are concerned, on the other hand, the state policies and initiatives that are coming up in relation to racism, discrimination and the respect of equality are far from efficient, while some do not even exist”⁶⁷.
- [57]. The OSCE Annual Report from 2006 on Hate Crimes in the OSCE region reports for Greece the following case: ‘a 16-year-old girl of Bulgarian origin was reportedly raped in a school toilet by four boys in an incident that precipitated a national dialogue in Greece.’⁶⁸ Moreover, the report focuses on the prompt reaction of high officials condemning the incident and racism against immigrants in general. Vandalism of holocaust monuments and establishment of holocaust’s commemoration are also mentioned⁶⁹. This case has been reported in the RAXEN Data Collection Report 2006 for Greece.
- [58]. Riots in Greek prisons in early summer 2007 have drawn the attention of the public and competent authorities throwing spotlight on allegedly inhumane conditions prevailing in Greek prisons. Overcrowding is indicative (10,627 detainees in 26 prisons constructed for 6,843) as well as the differential treatment of foreign inmates regarding their requests to a leave (art.54 of penitentiary code). According to the Greek Ombudsman, inmates of Greek nationality receive a leave in 55,84% of cases, while the respective number for

65 www.amnesty.org.gr

66 HLHR-KEMO *Annual Report 2007*, Miltos Pavlou, *Racism and discrimination against immigrants and minorities in Greece: the state of play*, April 2007, <http://www.hlhr.gr/hlhr-kemo/docs/HLHR-KEMO%20AR2007.pdf>

67 Shashati Adla - Hellenic Sudanese Friendship League, Mardaki Andriana - SOS RACISM GR, ENAR 2006 Shadow Report for Greece (2007).

68 OSCE, Hate Crimes in the OSCE region: incidents and responses, *Annual Report 2006*, ISBN 83-60190-44-5 © OSCE/ODIHR 2007 www.osce.org/odihr, p.15.

69 OSCE, Hate Crimes in the OSCE region: incidents and responses, *Annual Report 2006*, ISBN 83-60190-44-5 © OSCE/ODIHR 2007 www.osce.org/odihr, p.36, 97.

foreigners is 35,86%, therefore revealing discrimination practices.⁷⁰ With respect to Greek penitentiary system, currently one in two prisoners is a foreigner, and half of the 4,809 foreign prisoners are Albanians.⁷¹

- [59]. On 17.07.2007, the European Parliament Committee on Civil Liberties and Justice and Home Affairs Delegation, issued its Report on the Visit to Greece and to the detention facilities of refugees and immigrants. Among other, the Committee Delegation described the conditions in Samos as squalid, deplorable, inhuman and unacceptable, adding that it should be immediately closed down.⁷² UNHCR-Greece visited the Samos aliens' holding centre premises on early October 2007.⁷³ The head of the UNHCR Office in Greece stressed that the conditions constitute an insult to human dignity and asked for its immediate closure.⁷⁴
- [60]. An escalation of racist incidents in autumn 2007 against immigrants and minorities (see below) caused the reaction of civil society organisations and general perplexity about the rise of racism and a change in nature of violent incidents. Groups of extreme right wing bikers dressed in military clothes have repeatedly attacked settlements and apartments of mainly Pakistani immigrants in the municipality of Renti (within the wider Piraeus area). During the same period, the police officers have repeatedly entered mosques unannounced during the Ramadan prayer, irrupting without a warrant and without taking their shoes off, in order to perform the unsuccessful drug inspections.⁷⁵ HLHR-KEMO issued a press release according to which racist violence is on the rise in Greece, emphasising the fact that this major shift coincides with the outcome of the recent elections - the extreme right wing party representatives entered the parliament for the first time since the dictatorship. The press release also focuses on the fact that improvised mosques in the past used to be generally respected and protected by the police and local society, according to the Islamophobia report 2005 for Greece (see below).

70 Ombudsman report: www.synigoros.gr/docs/Malandrino_Ekthesi_Autopsias.pdf

71 The government refuses the Ombudsman full access to prisons, claiming that the later are out of its jurisdiction. Various non-governmental, academic and political actors have taken a stance in support of the Ombudsman. Kathimerini, (11.05.2007) www.ekathimerini.com/4dcgi/news/content.asp?aid=83323

72 [www.europarl.europa.eu/registre/commissions/libe/proces_verbal/2007/07-02/LIBE_PV\(2007\)07-02_EN.doc](http://www.europarl.europa.eu/registre/commissions/libe/proces_verbal/2007/07-02/LIBE_PV(2007)07-02_EN.doc)
www.europarl.europa.eu/news/public/story_page/022-7908-169-06-25-902-20070615STO07873-2007-18-06-2007/default_en.htm

73 Kathimerini, (03.10.2007) *Απαράδεκτες συνθήκες κράτησης στη Σάμο*, http://news.kathimerini.gr/4dcgi/_w_articles_politics_154382_03/10/2007_243738.

74 The UNCHR Office visited also the Lesvos holding centre at Pagani, where conditions were better, though there was room for improvement. The UNHCR office urged for the implementation of an EU funded project which amounts to 650.000€ and concerns equipment and infrastructure improvements of the detention facilities. Aiolika Nea, Εύσημα στη Νομαρχία για το Κέντρο Λαθρομεταναστών (05.10.2007) <http://diavatirio.net/diavat/news.1482>

75 HLHR-KEMO press release on the rise of racist violence in Greece (15.10.2007), www.hlhr.gr/press/10-2007-RAC-Attacks%20HLHR-%CA%C5%CC%CF.pdf.

- Next follows a list of detailed examples of notable incidents against immigrants and minorities that received public/media attention:
- [61]. In mid-June 2007 a video clip⁷⁶ showing police torture against two young immigrants in summer 2006 was published on the web.⁷⁷ This five-minute long recording was done by the mobile telephone. The incident quickly became the main news and it triggered a great amount of discussions on racist violence, causing heavy political tension. The police officers involved were suspended by the public order ministry, while the Athens public prosecutor brought criminal charges against them.⁷⁸ Over the following days of June and July other mobile phone videos were published showing police officers mistreating and humiliating two transsexuals and other detainees. As a result, certain victims of similar offences in the past years denounced with delay their ill-treatment.⁷⁹ The recurrence of such incidents mostly against immigrants by the police over the last years did not lead to defining them as racially motivated crimes, but rather as an issue of the police violence in general. Civil society organisations, among which Amnesty International and Hellenic League for Human Rights issued press releases advocating for the protection of the victims and the end of impunity.⁸⁰ Moreover, according to the Panhellenic Federation of Police Officers, after the latter criticised heavily the Ministry of Public Order for the impunity of officers involved in the above videos, the Ministry ordered a formal disciplinary investigation (sworn administrative examination) against the members of the Federation's presidency⁸¹.
- [62]. A young Albanian driver was allegedly stopped for a police identity check. After revealing his nationality, the officers allegedly took him to the Ierissos police station and beaten him, while one of the police officers offered to free him upon bribe.⁸²
- [63]. A 21-year-old fast-food delivery driver of Pakistani nationality was allegedly beaten in Nea Erythraia, northern Athens, by five men who stole approximately 400 euros from him. The man was hospitalised after the attack.⁸³

76 The video showed two youths in the Athens police station of Omonia being forced to slap one another on the face, while a police officer was kicking and hitting them with a wooden stick, ordering them to "hit harder".

77 The YouTube video: <http://athens.indymedia.org/features.php3?id=477>.

78 Specifically, two were charged with police brutality and the other two with complicity. Another three police officers were charged with misdemeanours, including harbouring a criminal and dereliction of duty. No resignation of high public officers or minister took place.

79 Similar police violence episodes took place in this very period and they were met with the overwhelming public disapproval.

80 Ioanna Sotirhou, Διεθνής Αμνηστία: Να σταματήσει αμέσως η ατιμωρησία, In: *Eleftherotipia*, (19.06.2007), www.enet.gr/online/online_text/c=112,id=60380516.

81 Official document n. 900/96/3a/11.10.2007 of the Panhellenic Federation of Police Officers addressed to HLHR-KEMO, RAXEN NFP.

82 Ta Nea (21.05.2007) www.tanea.gr/Article.aspx?d=20070521&nid=4780268.

83 Kathimerini, (10.03.2007) www.ekathimerini.com/4dcgi/news/content.asp?aid=81087.

- [64]. Twenty-six human rights groups have signed a petition to prevent the deportation of 41 illegal immigrants from Iraq alleged to have been beaten by the Greek police. The groups were protesting against plans to send the migrants back to Turkey, from where they were brought to Chios in March 2007, claiming that police had beaten some of them when they refused to board buses to be deported.⁸⁴
- [65]. On 22.07.2007, a 36-year-old Albanian immigrant was beaten to death in the city of Volos (central Greece) during a clash between groups of Greeks and Albanians. Three persons were charged for homicide.⁸⁵
- [66]. 13 immigrants were indicted to trial for the assassination of 2 young immigrants (an Albanian and a Georgian) after the inter-ethnic conflict that took place on May 2007 between the groups of Albanian and of ex-USSR immigrants at the square of Thessalonica railway station (Xirokrini district). The conflict was triggered by a verbal insult, to escalate into a clash involving some 30 young people from both communities who were passing by.⁸⁶
- [67]. On 18.08.2007, a young Nigerian itinerant street vendor jumped to death from the 1st floor balcony of a café in Kalamaria, Thessalonica while fleeing from two plainclothes policeman. Groups of immigrants and various organisations accused the police for the incident, some weeks prior to which the Nigerian man had allegedly been mistreated and beaten by the police officers who arrested him for selling CDs on streets. Numerous protests followed the immigrant's death over the next days in Thessalonica, accusing the police of racist practices. During one such protest 20 persons were arrested and allegedly beaten by the police. A senior Nigerian diplomat in Athens appealed for calm on 22.08.2007 after four nights of riots.⁸⁷
- [68]. During the autumn period groups of extreme right wing bikers in military clothes have repeatedly attacked settlements and apartment of immigrants (mostly Pakistani) in the municipality of Renti (within the wider Piraeus area).⁸⁸
- [69]. In Thebes area, in a neighbourhood where many Pakistan and Afghan workers live, a local Greek resident allegedly fired rifle shots while shouting "It is Greece here!" against a group of Afghan agricultural workers returning home at

84 Kathimerini (03.04.2007) GHM press release:
http://cm.greekhelsinki.gr/uploads/2007_files/ghm885_omct_iraqi_asylum_seekers_english.doc.

85 <http://diavatirio.net/diavat/print.php?news.1259>.

86 Eleftherotipia, (07.09.2007),
www.enet.gr/online/online_text/c=112,dt=07.09.2007,id=100010216.

87 In.gr, (19.08.2007) www.in.gr/news/print.asp?lngEntityID=824997&lngDtrID=244,
 (20.08.2007) www.in.gr/news/print.asp?lngEntityID=825269&lngDtrID=244,
diavatirio.net/diavat/news.php?extend.1296, Kathimerini, (23.0.8.2007).
www.ekathimerini.com/4dcgi/news/content.asp?aid=87040.

88 <http://diavatirio.net/diavat/news.php?extend.1503>.

the end of a working day. One Afghan worker was injured and recovered at the local Thebes hospital. After the incident, Pakistan and Afghan residents gathered and directed themselves towards the house of the Greek man. The local police force arrested five persons (two Pakistan, two Afghan citizens and the Greek perpetrator).⁸⁹

[70]. Amnesty International – Greece has reported an incident of ill-treatment of a Moldavia immigrant woman at the General Athens Police Directorate (GAPD). The woman was allegedly arrested at her home by the police officers in civilian clothes and then taken to the GAPD, where she was beaten, asked to take her clothes off, kicked and threatened in order to reveal information about her partner. The state hospital where she was recovering verified her head injuries and she sued the police officers.⁹⁰

[71]. In the Candia Police station (Crete) an Iraqi asylum seeker was beaten by the police officers after insisting to submit an asylum application, as he was advised to do by a competent Athens NGO. According to the allegations, the police officers did not tolerate his persistence to submit the application and beat him out of the police station. The photos of marks on his body from the beatings appeared in the national newspapers on the next day.⁹¹

- Suicides of detained immigrants

[72]. In March 2007, a 20-year-old Albanian suspect allegedly hung himself in the police detention centre at the Ilion station in western Athens. The Albanian national was arrested on Saturday together with a Greek woman on suspicion that they had been robbing youngsters. During the same period, a 15-year-old Polish national, detained in the Avlona prison for drug use (marijuana), committed suicide at the Koridalos prison psychiatry. The case was in the focus of national media for several days.⁹²

- Hate speech

[73]. The extreme right wing party LAOS ('Popular Orthodox Alert', laos=folk) issued a press release on devastating forest fires in Greece in the summer 2007,

89 G.D., Eleftherotipia (25.09.2007)
www.enet.gr/online/online_text/c=112,dt=25.09.2007,id=56997664.

90 www.amnesty.org.gr, Eleftherotipia, *Αστυνομικοί κακοποίησαν μετανάστρια. Περιστατικό ενδεικτικό της βίας που ασκείται σε βάρους ακόμη και νόμιμων μεταναστών και ας μην υπάρχει τίποτα σε βάρους τους* (13.06.2007).

91 Liviakis Y., Eleftherotipia (11.06.2007), indymedia.org (11.06.2007).

92 Eleftherotipia, (23.04.2007) http://www.enet.gr/online/online_print?id=100325524.

advancing the hypothesis that immigrants may be the arsonists, as potential ‘enemies of this country’.⁹³

- [74]. The pre-electoral program of the above party contains a section on irregular immigrants, considering them to be ‘the most serious plague of the Greek society today’.⁹⁴
- [75]. A video showing Greek Army marines singing racist songs against Albanian immigrants received media attention in Albania and caused tensions and burnings of the Greek flag. The National Defence Ministries of both countries have condemned the incident.⁹⁵
- [76]. Racism in Sport: During football matches Albanian football players of Greek teams and their families often face verbal attacks. Two notable examples are those of Sotiris Ninis and Alban Bushi of Albanian origin.⁹⁶

- Anti-Semitic offences

- [77]. A far-right representative, the lawyer Costas Plevris, and the extreme right wing newspaper Eleftheros Cosmos are on trial (in court December 2007) on charges of violating the anti-racist law (n.927/79) for anti-Semitism and hate-speech. Plevris, the author of an anti-Semitic book published in late 2006 and entitled “Jews: The Whole Truth,” has been accused of publishing several anti-Semitic articles in the newspaper and “inciting actions that could provoke discrimination, hatred and violence against persons and groups of persons, solely because of their racial and ethnic origins.” (more in the ‘Legal Issues’ section)
- [78]. According to the Greek Helsinki Monitor, Greek state agencies - in particular Greek National Tourism Organisation - continue to promote the custom of

93 http://www.laos.gr/press/press270807_1.htm 27.08.2007.

94 www.laos.gr, <http://diavatirio.net/diavat/news.php?extend.1323>.

95 Stavros Tzimas, Ανθελληνική θύελλα στην Αλβανία για το βίντεο της ντροπής ,In: *Kathimerini* (06.03.2007)
news.kathimerini.gr/4dcgi/_w_articles_politics_190852_06/03/2007_218358.

96 According to media reports, the former suffered verbal offences during games, while the wife and relatives of the latter were also mistreated and beaten when cheering the goals he scored. During a match Bushi reacted by spitting at an opponent player and by showing insulting gestures towards the bench of the Athens team Panathinaikos. He was punished with the fine of 40.160 Euros, and three matches out of the game. The Supreme Court public prosecutor Mr. Kanellopoulos ordered an inquiry in order to assess whether he was residing in Greece illegally. The allegations on racist verbal attacks and beatings were not investigated. Pantelis Boukalas, Γηπεδικός Πατσισμός, In: *Kathimerini.gr* (07.02.2007)
http://news.kathimerini.gr/4dcgi/_w_articles_columns_206198_07/02/2007_215013,
Eleftherotipia, 19.04.2007,27.04.2007, *Kathimerini*, 20.04.2007,
news.kathimerini.gr/4dcgi/_w_articles_columns_571287_20/04/2007_224049.

“burning of Judas” as a tourist attraction,⁹⁷ not acknowledging that it manifests anti-Semitism.⁹⁸

- Islamophobic offences

[79]. Police agents invaded in an improvised mosque in Geraniou Street in Athens during the Ramadan prayer to perform drug inspection, paying no respect either to a larger number of people at the site - immigrants mostly from Pakistan and Bangladesh – or to the religious character of the site (police officers did not take their shoes off). According to the mosque’s Bangladeshi imam, this was the forth police drug investigation irruption within fifteen days, albeit without any findings.⁹⁹ NGOs report that this unusual practice has not been encountered in the past¹⁰⁰.

- Anti-Roma offences

[80]. In June 2007 a number of Roma families were evacuated from the Votanikos area in the centre of Athens by Greek authorities without any proper legal procedure and without providing them with alternative accommodation.¹⁰¹ The Greek Ombudsman, in an urgent letter addressed to the Athens Mayor, pointed out the responsibility of the Athens Municipality to assure the availability and guarantees to the evicted families of a new safe and acceptable settlement in cooperation with the Athens Region.¹⁰² The Greek Helsinki Monitor Director P. Dimitras sued the mayor of Athens for violating the anti-racist law n.927/1979.

97 www.gnto.gr/pages.php?pageID=423&langID=2.

98 Greek Helsinki Monitor press release (07.04.2007)
http://cm.greekhelsinki.gr/uploads/2007_files/ghm872_burning_of_judas_english.doc.

99 Eleftherotipia, (04.10.2007), www.enet.gr/online/online_text/c=112,id=90381088.

100 HLHR-KEMO press release on the rise of racist violence in Greece (15.10.2007), www.hlhr.gr/press/10-2007-RAC-Attacks%20HLHR-%CA%C5%CC%CF.pdf.

101 The Roma ‘cleaning operation’ was performed through a synergy of the Athens Municipality Garbage Service and representatives of a private company. The former proposed to the Roma families to sign a formal application for taking away their belongings as ‘heavy garbage’, and the latter offered to each family the sum of 1,000 euros in cash to abandon the area. BBC video by Malcolm Brabant about the Roma settlement in Votanikos.
<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qNSXXHwUmzw>.

102 IOS-Eleftherotipia, (24.06.2007)
http://www.enet.gr/online/online_print?id=16585828,22314468,30196580,44509412,5241204, The Greek Ombudsman (14.06.2007), Greek Helsinki Monitor, Centre on Housing Rights and Evictions (COHRE) Statement to the Fifth Human Rights Council, 11-18.06.2007, <http://deviousdiva.com/2007/06/08/votanikos/> blog.

[81]. A Roma-only school (allegedly a ghetto) in the neighbourhood Psari of Aspropyrgos - wider area of Athens complex - was burnt down during the Easter school holiday after an arson attack.¹⁰³

- Religiously motivated offences

[82]. In autumn 2007 a vandalism of a Catholic cemetery graveyard occurred in Candia (Crete). Grave tombs and crosses were desecrated and broken. The Catholic Diocese of Syros-Thira-Crete issued a protest declaration against the vandalisms, protesting among other against the indifference of Greek authorities, the lack of protection and any kind of compensation or assistance measure.¹⁰⁴

B.7. Good practice

[83]. A number of Antiracist festivals were held in various Greek cities. On 6-8.07.2007 the Athens Antiracist Festival was held for the 12th consecutive year at the Protomaya square in the centre of Athens, co-organised by a number of NGOs and coordinated by the Network for Social Support of Immigrants and Refugees.¹⁰⁵

[84]. With the occasion of the European Anti-Racist Week (14-21.03.2007) and within the framework of the anti-racism campaign in Greece 'all different-all equal',¹⁰⁶ events were held in the major Greek cities of Athens and Thessalonica.¹⁰⁷ The events promoted by the Council of Europe aiming at combating racism and xenophobia were organised by the National Youth

103 This improvised prefabricated Roma-only school was created in September 2005 as a result of pressure exercised by the non-Roma residents who did not want their children to attend the same classes as the Roma. Despite the subsequent reaction of the Ministry of Education and the Greek Ombudsman, the Roma families chose to have a Roma-only school right next to their settlement. During the very first year of its operation, some of its windows were broken, then it was vandalised by offensive graffiti, its air-conditioning units were stolen, and finally, in April 2007, it was burnt down. According to the latest information, the school is partially restored but still not operational. Kathimerini, (23.06.2007), www.ekathimerini.com/4dcgi/_w_articles_columns_1474557_23/06/2007_84862.

104 Eleftherotipia, *Για 3η φορά στόχος ιερόσυλων το Καθολικό Νεκροταφείο Χανίων*, (18.10.2007) http://www.enet.gr/online/online_text/c=112,id=84612112.

105 www.tsamadou13.gr, www.diktio.gr

106 www.oloiisoi.gr

107 Ifigenia Diamanti, *Εκστρατεία κατά ρατσισμού και ξενοφοβίας*, In: *Kathimerini.gr* (01.02.2007) http://news.kathimerini.gr/4dcgi/_w_articles_ell_184842_01/02/2007_214308, *Kathimerini.gr* (16.03.2007), *Anti-racist campaign, Syntagma station hosts initiative* www.ekathimerini.com/4dcgi/news/content.asp?aid=81284.

Council¹⁰⁸ and supported by the General Secretariat for the Young Generation¹⁰⁹ and NGOs.

[85]. Tony Onouha, the Nigerian itinerant street vendor lost his life jumping to death from the first floor of the cafe, while fleeing from two plainclothes policeman (see above). The Nigerian Community, the Forum of Migrants and the Antiracist Initiative of Thessalonica organised a solidarity concert to raise funds for the transportation of his corps and to cover the funeral expenses of his family.¹¹⁰

[86]. The HLHR-KEMO RAXEN National Focal Point has elaborated and disseminated on-line anti-discrimination forms¹¹¹ to NGOs, civil society organisations and stakeholders, as well as to the wider public, in order to facilitate and increase the validity and credibility of reporting of racist violence incidents and of good practices related to combating discrimination and racism.¹¹² The on-line ‘Racist violence incident’ form serves for recording violent incidents against immigrants and minorities, irrespective of whether the relevant complaint has been lodged. It is a victimisation survey form, available in Greek language. The objective of this initiative is to raise the visibility of racist violence and to improve the validity and credibility of reporting such offences. It also aims at encouraging the NGOs and immigrant and minority communities to report the racially motivated violent incidents to the police and competent authorities. It aids the process of collecting necessary data to establish facts for an alleged racist motivation. This form has been elaborated on the basis of the minimum requirements for data required for the RAXEN National Data Collection Report. The form contains fields for:

- categorisations of the racist violent incidents
 - violence against the person
 - vandalism of property
 - verbal threats and abusive behaviour - including harassment and hate speech
 - antisemitic – islamophobic literature and internet
- categorisations of victims

108 Εθνικό Συμβούλιο Νεολαίας (www.esyn.gr).

109 Γενική Γραμματεία Νέας Γενιάς (www.neagenia.gr). They included art and graffiti happenings, documentaries, photography exhibitions, juggling shows, body-painting workshops and theatrical performances in public spaces like the Metro stations and open squares.

110 Eleftherotipia. *Αλληλεγγύη στην οικογένεια του Τόνι*, (24.09.2007), www.enet.gr/online/online_text/c=112,id=24276320.

111 www.hlhr.gr/hlhr-kemo/hlhr-kemo.htm.

112 The respective forms ΘΕΤΙΚΕΣ ΠΡΩΤΟΒΟΥΛΙΕΣ & ΚΑΛΕΣ ΠΡΑΚΤΙΚΕΣ ΚΑΤΑ ΤΩΝ ΔΙΑΚΡΙΣΕΩΝ (‘Positive initiatives and good practices against discrimination’) and ΠΕΡΙΣΤΑΤΙΚΑ ΡΑΤΣΙΣΤΙΚΗΣ ΒΙΑΣ (‘Racist Violence Incidents’) were also distributed to the competent public administration services within the framework of networking and data collection for RAXEN 2007.

- immigrants
- Roma – travellers
- religious minority
- racial background (perceived belonging to a minority group)
- victims of multiple discrimination
- categorisations of alleged perpetrators
 - police
 - public employees
 - employers-colleagues-partners in employment
 - in market transactions – banks – tenant
 - extremist groups – right wing, interethnic gangs etc.
- Further data include gender, age, location and time of the crime occurrence, as well as identification data of the person reporting the incident (required exclusively for purposes of authentication and check of validity – reliability of the data provided).

[87]. According to information provided officially to the RAXEN NFP, the Panhellenic Federation of Police Officers develops a wide range of actions, projects, and recommendations aiming at the awareness-raising of the police officers, in order to combat racism and discrimination, and to protect the victims.¹¹³ The Panhellenic Federation of Police Officers (POASY) interevenes publicly in favour of the victims of police violence and against the impunity of perpetrators. It organises conferences and initiatives against police and state abuse. In a November 2005 conference entitled ‘Aliens in our homeland’ the POASY recommended that immigrants be recruited as police officers, in order to familiarise the Greek police force with the problems that immigrants face in Greece. Moreover, the Federation’s Institute of Studies and Documentation participated in the past in the EU-funded projects ‘Combating Discrimination in Police’ and ‘Pan-hellenic sensitisation of police officers regarding the trafficking victims’. In July 2007, in its press release, the POASY heavily criticised the Ministry of Public Order for the impunity of officers involved in police violence (with the occasion of the videos showing police brutality in the Omonia Police station). As a response, the Minister ordered a formal disciplinary investigation (sworn administrative examination) against the members of the Federation’s presidency¹¹⁴. The investigation is still pending. In September 2007, the European Confederation of Police (EUROCOP) addressed a letter to the competent Interior Minister calling the government to refrain from

113 Among other, the Federation recommended that the third country nationals be recruited in the police force and that effective persecution and punishment of perpetrators of racist violence are necessary guarantees for the protection of the Police Body from racist acts in the future. Official document n. 900/96/3a/11.10.2007 of the Panhellenic Federation of Police Officers addressed to HLHR-KEMO, RAXEN NFP.

114 Official document n. 900/96/3a/11.10.2007 of the Panhellenic Federation of Police Officers addressed to HLHR-KEMO, RAXEN NFP.

any actions impeding police unions from exercising their lawful role and asked that the unjustified charges against representatives of the POASY be dropped.¹¹⁵

- [88]. The Ministry of Employment and Social Protection organised a two-day campaign (15-16/10/2007) in five squares of the centre of Athens in order to inform the public about the Greek and European legislation concerning the fight against discrimination. The title of the campaign was “Fight against the discriminations. Be informed about your rights”.
- [89]. The Ministry of Employment and Social Protection organised a one-day seminar (5/9/2007) in Thessalonica to train the public servants working in the Labour Inspection Service (one of the three specialised equality bodies in Greece) in the Northern Greece, in the field of the antidiscrimination legislation. The title of the seminar was “Make equality a reality”.
- [90]. The Hellenic League for Human Rights¹¹⁶ organised a one-day conference (21.3.2007) in Athens for its members, lawyers and activists, to inform them about the recent Greek legislation for gender equality, in conformity with the Directive 2002/73/EC. It goes noted that gender equality does not fall within the direct scope of this report but cases of multiple discrimination cannot be ignored.
- [91]. The Greek Police has assigned ‘Intraway,’ a private sector enterprise for management, consulting, technology services and outsourcing, to perform a research regarding the specific needs for police protection, treatment and support of special population groups, among which ethnic minorities, Roma and Travellers, migrants, asylum seekers and refugees. The survey ‘Definition of necessary security actions of the Greek Police for the Support of Special Population Groups’ consisted of collecting detailed questionnaires on the specific needs of special population groups and performing 210 interviews of NGOs and immigrant and minority associations’ representatives throughout Greece.¹¹⁷

¹¹⁵ European Confederation of Police (EURO COP), letter to the Interior Minister Mr Pr.Pavlopoulos, 20.09.2007. www.eurocop-police.org

¹¹⁶ www.hlhr.gr

¹¹⁷ www.intraway.gr

C. Key areas of social life

C.1. Employment

C.1.1. New complaints and monitoring bodies – differentiated data

- [92]. There is no new complaint mechanism or monitoring body to record and/or register complaints on discrimination in employment.

C.1.2. Racism and discrimination (incidents and practices)

C.1.2.1. Brief overview

- [93]. A very low number of cases (three) concerning discrimination have been investigated by the Greek Ombudsman, Equality Body for the public sector. None have been investigated by the equality body competent for the discrimination in employment in the private sector. However, reports, surveys and researches, as well as civil society stakeholders and social partners indicate wage gaps, ethnic discrimination in employment and recruitment, as well as degrading working conditions for migrants. They furthermore show that no special attention or positive discrimination is being given to religious difference and particular needs in the workplace.
- [94]. The competent Labour Inspection Body (*Σώμα Επιθεώρησης Εργασίας* - SEPE) has never recorded any case or incident of racism, discrimination, violence or xenophobia against immigrants and minorities in employment.¹¹⁸ SEPE has recorded eight cases of illegal employment of immigrants during the period 01.01.2007-31.07.2007, half of which in Athens.¹¹⁹

118 According to the official document n.31286/01.10.2007 of SEPE addressed to HLHR-KEMO.

119 According to the official document n.31286/01.10.2007 of SEPE addressed to HLHR-KEMO.

C.1.2.2. Statistical Data and tables on incidents of discrimination and racism

- [95]. In Annex 5 the original table of the Labour Inspection Body shows cases of illegal employment of immigrant workers.
- [96]. There is no official statistical table provided by the Ombudsman (Equality Body for the public sector) on cases of discrimination in employment on grounds of ethnic or racial origin.

C.1.2.3. Exemplary cases

- [97]. The Greek Ombudsman investigated three key cases of discrimination on the basis of ethnic origin.¹²⁰
- [98]. a. In the case no. 3833/2006, the Greek Ombudsman examined whether ethnic origin should be a prerequisite for the exercise of the profession of a lawyer. After the mediation of the Ombudsman the complainant was appointed as a lawyer with a six month delay after her successful participation in the examination¹²¹.
- [99]. b. In the complaint no. 7500/2006, the Greek Ombudsman examined whether the ethnic origin should be a prerequisite for applying for a post of teaching staff. The GO asked this case to be re-examined since by the date the Law comes into force any legislative or regulatory provision contrary to the principle of equal treatment is being abolished¹²².
- [100]. c. In the case no. 19747/2005, the Greek Ombudsman examined the dismissal of an instructor for the reason that she did not hold the Greek citizenship. The complainant sought recourse to the courts against the aforementioned decision. The final court decision is pending and thus the GO cannot proceed with the mediation procedure¹²³.
- [101]. The Athens Labour Centre issued a press release denouncing fraud at the expense of immigrants who submit regularisation applications at the local municipal offices without fulfilling the legal requirements. In return they receive a receipt with the indication “legal requirements not fulfilled”. Those

120 All three cases are reported extensively in section ‘A. Legal issues’ and are included in Annex 2C.

121 The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

122 The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

123 The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

applications are destined to be rejected, yet immigrants are misled into submitting them and paying the non-refundable 150€ fee.¹²⁴ According to information provided to HLHR-KEMO by the Greek Forum of Migrants, immigrants are led to believe that such application, even once rejected, may constitute proof of their present residence in the country, a legal base for the next potential forthcoming regularisation program.¹²⁵

C.1.3. The situation of immigrants and minorities in employment

C.1.3.1. Brief overview

[102]. According to a number of reports and researches published in 2007, ethnic discrimination in employment is a de facto reality for migrants, despite the especially limited number of discrimination cases reaching the competent authorities and equality bodies.

- Reports, surveys and research

[103]. In Jun 2007, the Greek Ombudsman published a Special Report on Unemployment, containing an extensive section on a de facto discrimination against immigrant workers within the social security and residence permit system.¹²⁶ The Ombudsman proposed to disconnect the social security of immigrant workers - and consequently, their unemployment subsidy rights - from their residence and administrative status, in view of the constitution, international conventions, as well as of the national and international courts' jurisprudence (ECHR).

[104]. The OECD SOPEMI report 2007 for Greece provides an insight into the policies for regularisation of immigrant workers in Greece, their failure and hypotheses on the reasons based on statistical data. See the relevant section below.

124 Athens Labour Centre (22.08.2007) www.eka.org.gr Eleftherotipia, (23.08.2007) www.enet.gr/online/online_text/c=112,dt=23.08.2007,id=27743000, Kathimerini, (23.08.2007) news.kathimerini.gr/4dcgi/_w_articles_ell_2_23/08/2007_238528

125 Such information has been provided within the RAXEN network cooperation between the GFM and HLHR-KEMO.

126 According to the Ombudsman, the social protection of immigrant workers against the risk of unemployment is restricted by the requirement to prove the legal residence in the country. This practice of the competent state agencies introduces a serious negative discrimination against them in comparison with the nationals in exercising their social security rights. The Greek Ombudsman, *Special Report on Unemployment* (June 2007) http://www.synigoros.gr/reports/EE_gia_ANERGIA_14.6.07.pdf

- [105]. According to the OECD 2007 Economic Survey on Greece, employment of illegal immigrants has satisfied a latent demand for less-skilled workers. Strong immigration during the 1990s increased the labour force by 5 to 10 percent, and their employment in the informal sector may have reduced the economic cost of rigidities, such as the minimum wage, in the formal labour market. The side effect is a large informal sector where minimum wage is not guaranteed to the - mostly illegal - immigrant workers.¹²⁷
- [106]. A research on ethnic discrimination in the labour market indicates that ‘ethnic discrimination in the Greek labour market is still significant’. According to the International Labour Organization standards, the researchers have estimated that Albanians face 43.5% less chance of access to occupations. As for the 49.7% of the cases who do have equal chances of access to occupations, they face ‘36.5% less chances of being registered with insurance coverage, while their potential wage contracts are 8.8% lower than those of Greeks and 5.3% below the legal minimum wage’.¹²⁸
- [107]. The Migrant Integration Policy Index, MIPEX¹²⁹ a major research project regarding a comparative study of the integration policies throughout EU - indicates that Greece has one of the least favourable policies (25th among the 28 countries compared) concerning immigrants’ labour market status.¹³⁰

127 OECD ECONOMIC SURVEYS: GREECE – ISBN 978-92-64-02104-4 – © OECD 2007, www.oecd.org

128 The research further outlines that, ‘interestingly, [for these findings] the employers themselves blame profit strategies (84.4%), statistical discrimination (9.6%), and taste discrimination (7.8%)’ Nick Drydakis Minas Vlassis (2007), *Ethnic Discrimination in the Greek Labour Market: Occupational Access, Insurance Coverage, and Wage Offers*, University of Crete Working Paper .

129 www.integrationindex.eu. MIPEX is produced by a consortium of 25 organisations. Associate partners for Greece are the Hellenic League for Human Rights and the Greek Ombudsman. MIPEX is led by the British Council and Migration Policy Group (MPG). The MIPEX regarded the comparative analysis of 140 indicators of legislation and policy concerning the immigrants’ integration in six areas: access to the labour market, long term residence, family reunion, nationality, political participation, anti-discrimination. For a comprehensive presentation of the comparative results with a specific focus on Greece see www.hlhr.gr – Pavlou M., Miltos (2007), *MIPEX 2007 -Presentation Results & Comments for Greece*, (16.10.2007), <http://www.hlhr.gr/hlhr-kemo/docs/Pavlou-mipex2007.ppt> [EL/EN].

130 In particular, according to the MIPEX findings, Greek policy for integration of migrants lacks measures encouraging integration, and migrants are only partially secure, since they lose their residence permit if unemployed, regardless of the number of years they may have worked in Greece. Moreover, the rights of migrant workers are restricted by rigorous rules on starting a business, changing the employer, position or industry of employment, as well as a geographical area. see www.hlhr.gr – Pavlou Miltos (2007), *MIPEX 2007 -Presentation Results & Comments for Greece*, (16.10.2007), <http://www.hlhr.gr/hlhr-kemo/docs/Pavlou-mipex2007.ppt> [EL/EN].

- [108]. A January 2007 edition of the Eurobarometer¹³¹ indicates that in Greece, illegal immigrants are considered to be significantly active in the undeclared labour market.¹³² By one of the highest percentages in the EU (67%, second only to Cyprus: 70%), Greeks believe that illegal immigrants are the category most likely to carry out undeclared work.¹³³
- [109]. A Migration Policy Institute (IMEPO) survey found that some employers do not treat migrant and Greek workers equally. Employers do not make social security contributions for 3.5 percent of Greeks, whereas 12.9 percent of migrants work uninsured. Furthermore, the average monthly income of a migrant household is 1,538€, significantly below that of a Greek family (approximately 600€ less).¹³⁴ The same research indicated that immigrant labour increases the Gross National Product by 1,5%.¹³⁵
- Accidents at work and working conditions
- [110]. Following fatal accidents of immigrant workers at work place, the hazardous working conditions, such as lack of safety and protection measures are denounced by workers' unions and reported in the media.¹³⁶ In one case the local Labour Centre intervened upon the alleged hesitation of competent authorities to report death and injuries of immigrant workers as work accidents, is documented in Zakynthos.¹³⁷
- [111]. One of the common patterns of immigrant work in small Greek enterprises is for workers to reside in the premises of the latter. In summer 2007, a 21-year-old Bulgarian immigrant worker died during a fire at the supermarket where he was working, but also residing with his family. He died while re-entering the burning store in an attempt to save his personal belongings.¹³⁸ In a makeshift

131 Special Eurobarometer 284 – *Undeclared work in the European Union* (October 2007) Fieldwork: May – June 2007, For Greece the sample was 1000 persons interviewed between 26.05.2007 – 20.06.2007.

132 Special Eurobarometer 284 – *Undeclared work in the European Union* (October 2007) p.40.

133 Special Eurobarometer 284 – *Undeclared work in the European Union* (October 2007) p.70.

134 Kathimerini, *Migrant families grow fast*, (20.01.2007) <http://www.ekathimerini.com/4dcgi/news/content.asp?aid=79115>.

135 Migration Policy Institute (IMEPO) www.imepo.gr.

136 In early October 2007, two Pakistani workers suffered sever burns in a foundry of the Renti municipality, allegedly due to the lack of safety precautions and equipment necessary to work with nitro-glycerine products. One of the two died shortly after the accident. The metal workers' union denounced the accident as well as various enterprises in the area that do not conform to the required safety measures and infrastructure standards. According to media reports, the competent prefecture and police authorities have closed down two enterprises, and union representatives are arguing against the tolerance of the situation by the authorities. Rizospastis, *Πεθαίνουν στις παράγκες του Ρέντι* (05.10.2007) <http://diavatirio.net/diavat/news.1476>.

137 Imera tsi Zakynthos, *Αναγνωρίστηκε ως εργατικό το ατύχημα σε οικοδομή στις Μαριές - Μετά την παρέμβαση του Εργατικού Κέντρου στο ΙΚΑ* (14.05.2007) <http://diavatirio.net/diavat/news.1006>.

138 Eleftherotipia (16.07.2007) www.enet.gr/online/online_print?id=63214068.

settlement of immigrant agriculture workers in Ilia (Peloponnesus) - near the Apideonas village - a fire started during the night and burned down some 15 makeshift shacks, their family homes.¹³⁹

- [112]. Numerous NGO press releases and media reports denounced exploitation and slavery conditions of immigrant workers, especially in the rural areas near Patras in Peloponnesus (Ahaia, Ilia).¹⁴⁰ In a widely publicised case Romanian workers were providing compulsory hard agricultural labour. They were paid only in food, and their passports were retained by the employers. The case was revealed but the Greek Helsinki Monitor denounced that employers were set free despite the grave offences they were charged of (trafficking, blackmailing, extortion).¹⁴¹

C.1.3.2. Statistical Data and tables on the situation of migrants and minorities

- [113]. Original statistical tables of a research¹⁴² on wage gap and ethnic discrimination in employment are presented in Annex 5.

- [114]. According to the data provided by the Social Insurance Foundation (IKA), foreign workers represent 14,2% of the insured workforce (men 16,48%, women 9,49%). Albanians are 53,92% of insured foreign workers and 60,19% of all men immigrant workers, while Pakistani and Russian men are 6,13% and 5,33% respectively. Albanian women are 38,79% of the total, Russian 17% and Bulgarian 12,22%. 46,63% of Albanian workers are employed in constructions.¹⁴³

¹³⁹ Eleftherotipia, *Οπου φτωχός κι η μοίρα του* (26.06.2007).

¹⁴⁰ Makis Nodaros, *Οι δουλέμποροι στην Αχαΐα με την ανοχή τοπικών παραγόντων και Αστυνομίας - Εστησαν στρατόπεδο συγκέντρωσης*, In: *Eleftherotipia* (05.04.2007) http://www.enet.gr/online/online_print?id=15817108, Patranews, *Τους ωθούσαν σε καταναγκαστική Εργασία*, (03.04.2007) <http://www.patranews.gr/news.asp?ID=4430>, Gowest, *Οι “σκλάβοι” της δυτικής Αχαΐας...*(04.04.2007), http://www.gowest.gr/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=8242&Itemid=352, Rizopastis, *Σύγχρονοι δούλοι στη γη της Ηλείας* (20.05.2007) <http://diavatirio.net/diavat/news.1007>, Makis Nodaros, *Ξηλώνουν τους καταυλισμούς της «ντροπής» αλλά...*, In: *Eleftherotipia* (22.02.2007), http://www.enet.gr/online/online_text/c=112,id=64338956.

¹⁴¹ Greek Helsinki Monitor press release, *Προσπάθεια υποβάθμισης τεράστιας υπόθεσης εμπορίας αλλοδαπών εργατών σε Αχαΐα* (10.04.2007), http://cm.greekhelsinki.gr/uploads/2007_files/ghm875_emporias_roumanon_ergaton_achaia_greek.doc.

¹⁴² Nick Drydakos and Minas Vlassis (2007), *Ethnic Discrimination in the Greek Labour Market: Occupational Access, Insurance Coverage, and Wage Offers*, University of Crete Working Paper.

¹⁴³ IKA bulletin June 2007.n.Γ71/10/27.06.2007. Original data table is provided in Annex 5.

[115]. According to official data provided by the Ministry of Interior, up to 31.08.2007 - thus one month before the expiry of the regularisation program initiated on September 2005 and then extended and prolonged twice - 152.400 immigrants had applied for a residence permit (par.10 & 11 of art.90 of the law n.3386/2005).¹⁴⁴ As the OECD SOPEMI 2007 report for Greece stresses, the number of applications ‘was less than expected, and the objective of the program has apparently been only partially achieved’, and ‘this seems to be attributable to the restrictions imposed, both concerning the number of days employed and the documents required’.¹⁴⁵ On 31.08.2007, according to official data of the Ministry of Interior, there were 473.547 immigrants holding valid residence permits.¹⁴⁶ More than 60% of them are based on employment (285.756). See Annex 5 for original data table.

C.1.3.3. Additional information

- [116]. There is a significant development regarding recording and evaluating participation of migrants and ethnic minorities in trade unions. For the first time quantitative data are provided to HLHR-KEMO, the RAXEN NFP. Up to 2006 the trade unions claimed that due to the absence of any discrimination whatsoever, no data on citizenship or ethnic origin was kept track of, and therefore no relevant statistics were available.¹⁴⁷ However, in October 2007 GSEE has reported that today some 20 immigrants are administration board members of the first degree trade unions that are members of the confederation, whereas no immigrant appeared as a representative of the respective trade union at the latest Annual GSEE Congress (March 2007).¹⁴⁸
- [117]. There is evidence of an increase in awareness of trade unions of their role in assisting discrimination victims. The Labour Institute of the General Confederation of Workers and its vocational training centre (KEK) implement a number of activities in order to empower migrant and refugee workers to deal with discrimination, and to exercise their labour rights (see below section ‘good practices’).

144 Official doc. n.19188/07/15.10.2007 addressed to HLHR-KEMO by the Interior Ministry Immigration Directorate.

145 OECD, International Migration Outlook 2007, SOPEMI report, p.250.

146 Official doc. n.19188/07/15.10.2007 addressed to HLHR-KEMO by the Interior Ministry Immigration Directorate Data CD attached.

147 Official response of GSEE to the NFP ‘Antigone’, prot.n.1666/21.09.2006.

148 Official response of GSEE n.1805/22.10.2007 to the formal request of HLHR-KEMO (16.09.2007). According to the General Confederation of Workers (GSEE), with respect to participation of immigrants and minorities in trade unions, the legally residing and employed third country nationals can be members of syndicalist unions on the basis of the art.71γ of law n.1264/1982. While the confederation is encouraging and welcoming participation of immigrants in the workers’ unions, it declares that is not possible to record and report – as requested - precisely and analytically data, such as nationality, gender or age of the workforce participating in the workers’ unions throughout the country.

C.1.4. Good practice

C.1.4.1. Policy initiatives

- [118]. The Ministry of Transport announced an initiative to facilitate the process of obtaining a driving license for Roma minority members. The Minister plans to provide candidate drivers with a special training and examination manuals that use a simplified language.¹⁴⁹
- [119]. The National Strategy Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion 2006-2008¹⁵⁰, coordinated by the Ministry of Employment and Social Protection in late 2006, includes immigrants among the beneficiary vulnerable groups¹⁵¹ in need of social inclusion and employment support.¹⁵² The first intervention axis is the fight against discrimination which aims ‘generally to raise awareness within society and to inform the particular population groups’.¹⁵³ The second intervention axis is ‘access to employment on equal terms’.¹⁵⁴ The evaluation of the National Plan for Social Inclusion for Greece concerning the promotion of social inclusion of the disabled, immigrants, and persons and groups with cultural and religious particularities, indicates that ‘although the identified priorities point in the right direction, further efforts are needed towards the adoption of an integrated and streamlined strategic approach.’¹⁵⁵ The country

149 www.yme.gr/print.php?type=2&printit=932 Kathimerini.gr, 07.08.2007.

150 Ministry of Employment and Social Protection, *National Strategy Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion 2006-2008* (September 2006), p.13

151 Immigrants and minorities (‘individuals/groups with cultural/religious particularities’) are provided with priority 4 as vulnerable groups together with disabled individuals. With respect to employment, actions for the social inclusion of immigrants are anticipated to ‘help to enhance social cohesion and to achieve economic growth and employment by drastically increasing their employment and income rates.’ Ministry of Employment and Social Protection, *National Strategy Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion 2006-2008* (September 2006), p.10.

152 According to the national strategy plan, individuals and groups with particular features (e.g. cultural particularities) ‘often make access to goods, services and employment hard and a modern and flexible framework needs to be instituted so as to record and certify immigrants’ vocational qualifications and match them with specific expertise.’ Ministry of Employment and Social Protection, *National Strategy Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion 2006-2008* (September 2006), p.13.

153 Ministry of Employment and Social Protection, *National Strategy Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion 2006-2008* (September 2006), p.29.

154 According to the National Strategy Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion A for 2005, ‘of all those who benefited from actions, 10% were immigrants, 4% were people with disabilities, 3% were gypsies and 20% were repatriated’ (ethnic Greek immigrants). Ministry of Employment and Social Protection, *National Strategy Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion 2006-2008* (September 2006), p.30.

155 ‘The links between the strategic priorities and the proposed interventions are not always sufficient, while the social inclusion objective of Governance is only partly addressed.’ Commission of the European Communities SEC(2007) 272/22.02.2007, *COMMISSION STAFF WORKING DOCUMENT Joint Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion COUNTRY PROFILES – Greece* p.73.

Profile evaluation for Greece suggests that the plan in general ‘lacks further concrete targets’ while ‘it fails to refer to the availability of budgetary and human resources considered necessary for its successful implementation and does not provide any pre-assessment.’¹⁵⁶ The evaluation report recommends to extend provision of services and the financial ‘safety net’ (minimum income) also to persons, such as ‘immigrants, disabled people, Roma and other vulnerable groups.’¹⁵⁷

C.1.4.2. Practical initiatives by civil society and government

- [120]. Seven offices of Support of Immigrants and Refugees are set up in the Labour Centres of Athens, Piraeus, Volos, Patras, Thessalonica, in the Greek Forum of Migrants-Athens, and within the NGO Praxis-Thessalonica. These offices are run by the Vocational Training Centre of the Labour Institute of GSEE (INE-GSEE) and are staffed by 15 labour consultants. Moreover, the INE-GSEE runs an Observatory for the Employment of Immigrants, that records and elaborates data on the issues and problems that arise from the application of the migration legislation.¹⁵⁸
- [121]. The Ministry of Employment and Social Protection implemented a number of targeted activities in 2007. Among other, the Ministry organized a conference on the ‘Application of Equal Treatment in Work and Employment’ in Thessalonica, within the framework of the EU project Combating Discrimination(2001-2006) and the 2007 Year of Equal Opportunities for All.¹⁵⁹
- [122]. A number of projects were implemented under the EQUAL initiative concern racism and xenophobia at the workplace and empowerment of immigrant workers through support and counselling.¹⁶⁰

156 The evaluation concludes that ‘despite the positive steps, social policy adjustments carried out so far have failed to address effectively the multidimensional problems and needs in the area of poverty and social exclusion’ while ‘the majority of undertaken measures appear to be fragmented and ‘the report fails to set quantitative targets and lacks information on associated resources and their availability.’ Commission of the European Communities SEC(2007) 272/22.02.2007, *COMMISSION STAFF WORKING DOCUMENT Joint Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion COUNTRY PROFILES – Greece* pp.73-74.

157 Commission of the European Communities SEC(2007) 272/22.02.2007, *COMMISSION STAFF WORKING DOCUMENT Joint Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion COUNTRY PROFILES – Greece* p.78.

158 Official response of GSEE n.1805/22.10.2007 to the formal request of HLHR-KEMO (16.09.2007). www.equal-ine-kek.gr

159 Ministry of Employment and Social Protection, Conference: ‘Application of Equal Treatment in Work and Employment’, in Thessalonica (05.09.2007), www.ypakp.gr/uploads/docs/2185.pdf

160 Official response of the Ministry of Employment n.201138/10.10.2007 to the data request of HLHR-KEMO.

C.2. Education

C.2.1. New complaints and monitoring bodies – differentiated data

- [123]. There are no new public or non-governmental bodies recording and processing complaints or allegations on racism and/or discrimination in education. There is no evidence of collection of data referring to ethnic/national origin or persons' religion or beliefs. A special Institute for the Greek Diaspora Education and Intercultural Studies¹⁶¹ - IPODE - connected to the Ministry of Education, collects data on the following groups: migrants, "Palinnostountes"¹⁶²- "Omogeneis"¹⁶³, "Thracian Muslims"¹⁶⁴ and Roma¹⁶⁵.

C.2.2. Racism and discrimination (incidents and practices)

C.2.2.1. Brief overview

- [124]. In September 2005, in the Psari district of Aspropyrgos – wider Athens area - an improvised prefabricated Roma-only school was created as a result of pressure exercised by the non-Roma residents who refused to accept Roma pupils attending classes together with their children. This school, that frequently suffered damage and theft of equipment, was finally burnt down by unknown perpetrators, in Spring 2007.¹⁶⁶ The school was not fully restored before late autumn 2007, due to the inability of the municipality to provide the necessary equipment, even if only two containers to be turned into classrooms.¹⁶⁷ However, according to the information provided by the Ombudsman for Children's rights, in November 2007, the school started to operate again with 25 Roma children attending classes.

161 www.ipode.gr

162 Repatriated Greeks

163 People of Greek ethnic origin having nationality other than Greek - in their majority coming for CIS states

164 Greek citizens - the only recognised minority

165 Mainly of Greek citizenship

166 The case of accident or of a fire set on purpose in order to cover evidence of other criminal acts can't be excluded.

167 S.Vradelis, Μαθημα πρώτον : Ρατσισμός, In: *Ta Nea* (01.16.2007) <http://assets.in.gr/AssetService/Image.ashx?t=2&pg=71231&>

C.2.2.2. Statistical data and tables on racist or religiously motivated incidents

- [125]. New forms of racist behaviour, barriers to access to education affecting the education of immigrants, refugees, asylum seekers and ethnic or religious minorities were not recorded. No racist, xenophobic or religiously motivated incidents were documented either.

C.2.2.3. Exemplary cases of discrimination¹⁶⁸

- [126]. 1. *Foreign born naturalized Greek – employment as teaching staff.* A foreign born Greek naturalized citizen, who applied for employment at the Non Commissioned Officers School of the Hellenic Army as a member of the teaching staff with an hourly remuneration contract, was disqualified on the basis of not being a Greek citizen by birth, a necessary precondition according to the post advertisement.¹⁶⁹
- [127]. 2. *Aliens of Greek ethnic origin - Special provisions for admission to higher education institutions.* According to the relevant legislation in force, students of Greek origin studying in EU member states are exempt from the special provisions pertaining to the admission of EU citizens in higher education institutions and fall necessarily under the special provisions for expatriates. However, discrimination against EU citizens on the grounds of their Greek origin comes into conflict with the provisions of Law 3304/2005, since the aforementioned exemption constitutes a direct discrimination on the grounds of ethnic origin.¹⁷⁰
- [128]. 3. *Alien students – housing benefit for students.* A female student from a third country filed a complaint because the competent Tax Office (DOY) had claimed a return of the housing benefit for students that she had been granted because, as officially confirmed, she was not a holder of the Greek citizenship.¹⁷¹
- [129]. A case of prohibition of displaying religious symbols has been documented. In a public lower secondary school in Athens - 2nd gymnasium of Agios Ioannis Rentis - a 12-year-old migrant girl temporarily stopped attending after being advised by the school headmaster to rethink her decision of wearing a headscarf, given that - as he pointed out - this may cause reactions and negative

168 Complaints investigated by the Greek Ombudsman. The Greek Ombudsman's 2006 *Annual Report on equal treatment*, published in 2007 (www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf)

169 See chapter A.Legal issues

170 See chapter A.Legal issues

171 See chapter A.Legal issues

comments of her schoolmates.¹⁷² The Ministry of Education declared¹⁷³ that the girl soon after that came back to school and is attending the classes regularly, wearing the scarf.¹⁷⁴

- [130]. There are no legal restrictions to access to education. However, practical restrictions often appear, mainly connected to the fact that some children - especially Roma children (Greek citizens) - do not get enrolled or do not attend regularly. Not obtaining elementary school certificate, this obstructs their ability to receive further training, and especially vocational training, for which elementary school certificate is required.¹⁷⁵

C.2.3. The situation of immigrants and minorities in education

C.2.3.1. Brief overview

- [131]. Since 1996, 26 inter-cultural state owned schools have opened in Greece –13 primary schools, nine junior highs and four senior highs, out of the total of 15,174 state schools. This makes up only 0.17 percent of the total. According to IPODE - Institute for the Greek Diaspora Education and Intercultural Studies¹⁷⁶ - today (school-year 2006-07) almost 113,000 foreign children, both migrant and repatriated, or some 10% of the total school population, attend Greek public primary and secondary schools.¹⁷⁷ According to the HLHR-KEMO 2007 Annual Report, the intercultural education implemented in 26 schools throughout Greece, is highly insufficient ‘to meet the needs of the children of over a million of immigrants.’¹⁷⁸
- [132]. According to the EKKE - Greek Social Research Centre - 58 percent of teachers in Greek schools believe that the presence of foreign pupils does not adversely affect the learning process, and 84 percent of primary school pupils and 76

172 P.Diamantakou, Με τη μαντίλα και το μπλουτζίν, In: *Ta Nea* (27.09.2007) <http://www.tanea.gr/Article.aspx?d=20070927&nid=6156901&sn=OPIZONTEΣ&spid=221>

173 Official information (Off.doc. N.108792/Γ2/02.10.2007 Ministry of Education) provided after Greek RAXEN-NFP official request.

174 See chapter A.Legal issues

175 G. Mavrommatis, “Παιδιά Ρομά στο Ελληνικό Δημόσιο Σχολείο” in S. Trubeta *Οι Ρομά στο σύγχρονο ελληνικό κράτος: Συμβιώσεις - Αναπρέσεις - Απουσίες*, Nefeli pbs. 2008 (in print).

176 www.ipode.gr

177 See relevant Annex 6 Table.

178 HLHR-KEMO Annual Report 2007, Miltos Pavlou, *Racism and discrimination against immigrants and minorities in Greece: the state of play*, April 2007, <http://www.hlhr.gr/hlhr-kemo/docs/HLHR-KEMO%20AR2007.pdf>, p.9.

percent of secondary school pupils say they have friends of a different nationality than their own.¹⁷⁹

C.2.3.2. Statistical data on participation and achievement in education

- [133]. There is no available data on rates of enrolment, attendance, drop-out, attainment or performance. There is no data available on participation rates in life-long learning or on literacy rates.

C.2.3.3. Statistical data on segregation

- [134]. No cases on segregation of immigrants, refugees, asylum seekers and ethnic minorities in education (including vocational training) were documented.

C.2.3.4. Statistical data on support measures for migrant and minority children

- [135]. In the school-year 2006-07, 286 reception classes (attended by 3,552 pupils) and 146 complementary classes (attended by 947 pupils) for migrant and repatriated pupils were held throughout Greece in public elementary schools.¹⁸⁰ Additionally, within the Programme ‘Education of Migrant and Repatriated Children’, an ‘intervention action’ takes place in parallel with the regular school, in a large number of primary and secondary schools throughout Greece providing support in Greek language learning as well as psychological support¹⁸¹
- [136]. During the school-year 2006-07, 76 teaching support classes and 41 art workshops for Roma pupils were held in public schools all over Greece, while 554 educators received training on the education of the Roma children.¹⁸²
- [137]. The Thracian Muslim Minority is the only officially recognised minority in Greece. Most of the Muslim children prefer to attend the minority primary schools, while, at the same time, most of these children prefer to attend public

179 Ten percent of school population are immigrants, In: *Kathimerini* (31.03.2007) <http://www.ekathimerini.com/4dcgi/news/content.asp?aid=81856>.

180 www.ipode.gr Data provided through the off.doc.n.462/26.10.2007, after RAXEN-NFP’s formal request on 16.09.2007.

181 www.ipode.gr Data provided through the off.doc.n.462/26.10.2007, after RAXEN-NFP’s formal request on 16.09.2007. See table no 2 in Annex 6.

182 www.ipode.gr Data provided through the off.doc.n.462/26.10.2007, after RAXEN-NFP’s formal request on 16.09.2007. See Table no 3 in Annex 6.

secondary schools (See table 4 in Annex 6). In the school year 2006-07, 142 substitute teachers (members of the minority, Greek higher/university education institutes graduates) were appointed in minority elementary schools while in the beginning of school-year 2007-08, 140 substitute and 32 permanent Thracian Muslim minority teachers were appointed in minority schools throughout Thrace. During school-year 2006-07, primary and secondary minority schools in Thrace were funded by the Greek state with 1,331,086 euros. There is a special provision for the Thracian Muslim upper secondary education graduates facilitating their access to higher/university education and a reservation of a certain number of university slots (See table 5A and 5B in Annex 6). In five public lower secondary schools (Gymnasiums) in Thrace, a pilot programme of teaching Turkish as a foreign language runs since 2005.¹⁸³

C.2.3.5. Multicultural education and anti-racist education

- [138]. Apart from Turkish language used in parallel with Greek in schools for Muslim Minority children in Thrace,¹⁸⁴ no other native language of migrant or minority children is used in public education in Greece. Apart from the Muslim minority teachers¹⁸⁵, who teach systematically Turkish in the minority schools in Thrace,¹⁸⁶ no other case of migrant or minority teacher teaching foreign languages and/or culture, or even working as an assistant in Greek public schools were located. There are no new legislative provisions for minority and multicultural education in 2007.
- [139]. Nevertheless, in all Pedagogy Faculties in Greek Universities lessons on antiracist and multicultural education are provided. Every one or two years Pedagogy Schools organise conferences regarding multicultural education, antiracist education, education of minorities and migrants etc.¹⁸⁷
- [140]. According to the Ministry of Education¹⁸⁸, the central concept of integrating ethnic, cultural and religious minorities in education is “mainstreaming” by integrating them in the regular education system. To that effect, the competent state authorities seek to enhance their Greek linguistic skills and offer support

183 www.ipode.gr Data provided through the off.doc.n.462/26.10.2007, after RAXEN-NFP’s formal request on 16.09.2007.

184 Use based on Greek-Turkish educational agreements dated back to the beginning of the 20th century. N. Askouni, *Η εκπαίδευση της μειονότητας στη Θράκη*, Alexandria pbs. 2006.

185 Mavrommatis, G. & Tsitselikis, K. (2003) Turkish. The Turkish Language in Education in Greece, Leeuwarden: Mercator-Education, www.mercator-education.org.

186 And in one case an Albanian and an Arab teacher teaching Albanian and Arabic to migrant children. See below in C.2.4 Good Practice.

187 See: www.eled.auth.gr, nured.auth.gr, www.komvos.edu.gr, www.unesco.auth.gr, www.ergastirio.ppp.uoa.gr, www.upatras.gr, www.kedek.gr, primary.edu.uoi.gr, www.rhodes.aegean.gr, ediamme.edu.uoc.gr, pms.pre.uth.gr

188 ‘EPEAEK II’ (Operational programme for education and initial vocational training) 2000-2006.

and assistance to their learning process. Therefore, under the concept of integrating immigrants and minorities in the regular education system designed on the basis of the Greek language and culture, little or no attention is given and no educational means are dedicated to multicultural aspects of education, such as bilingual children teaching methodology and support and targeted efforts to combat drop-out and exclusion. According to the HLHR-KEMO 2007 Annual Report, ‘measures for immigrant children in school do not challenge the structural and systemic role of the education system in the Greek society, still based on exclusion rather than inclusion and on ethnocentrism rather than multiculturalism.’¹⁸⁹ However, exclusion incidents such as those highlighted during the past years by the RAXEN reports and the HLHR-KEMO 2007 Annual Report (prohibition of enrolment of children of undocumented immigrants, later on withdrawn upon the Ombudsman intervention, the question of whether alien pupils should carry the national flag during school parades) have not been reported during the year 2007.

- [141]. In 2007 the implementation of three major projects carried out by university professors on behalf of the Ministry of Education, regarding the integration of immigrant, Roma and Thracian Muslim children in education, is in its final phase. “Education of Roma Children” and “Education of Muslim Children” programmes are to be completed by the end of 2007, after 10 years of successful presence and action in the field, while the programme “Education for Palinnostountes (ethnic Greek immigrants from CIS countries) and foreign Students” is to be completed in 2008.
- [142]. “Integration of repatriates and foreigners’ children into schools” had as a main target the creation of the preconditions that will provide migrant children with equal opportunities of access to all levels of education. The administration of the programme, based on reports submitted by local agents and co-operators (mainly teachers dealing with migrant children) estimates, among other, that the programme facilitated the smooth, gradual integration of migrant children into the Greek educational system in a number of ways: It provided psychological support and strengthened the children’s self-confidence, as well as ameliorated their place in the classroom; it reduced the violent incidents and the isolation phenomena; it contributed to the In general, it helped migrant pupils to deal with their learning difficulties and improve their school performance.¹⁹⁰
- [143]. “Integration of Roma children into school” programme aimed to enrol and integrate Roma children into the school system. In 2007 the programme is to be implemented in 170 schools throughout the country. The project provides the infrastructure, musical training and various artistic and entertainment activities.

¹⁸⁹ HLHR-KEMO *Annual Report 2007*, Miltos Pavlou, *Racism and discrimination against immigrants and minorities in Greece: the state of play*, April 2007, <http://www.hlhr.gr/hlhr-kemo/docs/HLHR-KEMO%20AR2007.pdf>, p.9.

¹⁹⁰ www.keda.gr

It includes a web portal, mapping of the target-group, as well as the provision of schoolbooks and educational material for Greek language and mathematics.

- [144]. “Education of Muslim Children”, strives to reduce educational and social inequalities concerning children of the Muslim minority of Thrace by enriching the school curriculum with extra supportive hours and by distributing a modern and effective educational material. The whole action had a very significant contribution to the general process of modernisation of the Muslim minority. One of the most significant results was the increase of the number of Muslim minority teenagers who attended secondary education. Despite the fact that dropout rates in compulsory education (six years elementary + three years lower secondary/gymnasium) still remain very high, the trends are showing a promising picture. Gymnasium attendance has almost quadrupled over less than 15 years, and the girls’ school attendance, although still low, is rapidly increasing.¹⁹¹

C.2.3.6. Support and involvement of parents and communities

- [145]. In Thrace - north-east Greece where the estimated 80,000 people of the Muslim Minority live - in the frame of the programme “Education of the Muslim minority children”, the operation of “Community Centres” proved to be one of the most successful initiatives of the programme. The operation of the centres gave the opportunity to a large number of Muslim minority parents to become more involved in the education process (at the same time lessons of Greek language were provided to minority parents who have Turkish as a mother tongue).¹⁹² This led to significant change in attitudes and increase in expectations of parents regarding the education of their children.¹⁹³
- [146]. With respect to the provision of support to enhance involvement of parents and communities, on 29.01.2007 in the city of Athens, where more than 500,000 migrants live, the mayor N. Kaklamanis announced that the municipality is planning to provide lessons of Greek language in the municipal kinder gardens for the mothers of migrant infants.¹⁹⁴

C.2.3.7. Religious symbols

- [147]. In Greek public schools, the display of religious symbols is permitted. In conformity to the art.13 of the Greek Constitution about religious freedom, a

¹⁹¹ www.museduc.gr

¹⁹² www.ipode.gr Data provided through the off.doc.n.462/26.10.2007, after RAXEN-NFP’s formal request on 16.09.2007.

¹⁹³ www.museduc.gr

¹⁹⁴ K. Theodosopoulou, *Ταχεία ένταξη μεταναστών με δράσεις στις γειτονιές*, In: *Naftemporiki*, (30.01.2007).

Presidential Decree (art.10 of the PD 201/1998) and a Ministerial Decision (Γ2/61723/13.06.2002) provide that the pupils may be exempted from assisting the religion class, the morning prayer, and from attending mass, as they are not obliged to declare their religious beliefs. Furthermore, a recent circular (76992/27.7.2006) implementing the recommendations of the Greek Ombudsman makes it clear that the function of confession is performed exclusively and only in the Church and not in school. In regard to religious symbols, there is no particular legislation in force. According to a relevant Ministry circular document 785/9.2.1982 *‘students may choose freely their dressing habits within the framework of objective dignity and social acceptance’*.¹⁹⁵

- [148]. No new national, regional or local legislation has been introduced on the display of religious symbols in education.
- [149]. In Thrace, where some 500 or more Muslim girls attend public secondary schools (Gymnasiums and Lyceums), there is allegedly a kind of “discourage strategy” regarding the display of typical Muslim headscarf. Putting forward the Letter of the Law that requires unvarying dressing during the school ceremonies, the administration allegedly advises the Muslim girls who wear the headscarf not to participate in the school parades. This despite the fact that such parades are a regular part of the school activities that take place in every Greek town during the national celebrations, i.e. three times per year.¹⁹⁶

C.2.4. Good practice

C.2.4.1. Policy initiatives

- [150]. In the framework of modernisation projects of the elementary school books, financed in large part by the EU funds, texts have partly abandoned their “traditional” strict ethnocentrism. In the texts of language lessons, one frequently meets heroes with no typical Greek names (obviously migrant), while there are always exercises of varying level of difficulty, in order to facilitate learning of Greek language by the pupils who do not have it as a mother tongue.¹⁹⁷
- [151]. ‘Learning Greek as a second language for migrant workers III’ program, designed and supervised by the Ministry of Education, General Secretariat on

195 Official document of the Ministry of National Education and Religions, prot.n.102497/Γ2/4.10.2006 and Φ25/932/104438/Γ1/10.10.2006.

196 Giorgos Mavrommatis - Field research findings.

197 Ministry of Education, Elementary Education, Greek language learning Teachers Books.

Adults Education, and financed in large by the EU funds, has been implemented in many towns throughout Greece.¹⁹⁸

- [152]. The Greek Nation Youth Council runs the campaign ‘All different - All equal’ in cooperation with the European Commission and the European Youth Forum, and in parallel with 41 European countries, from January 2007 till September 2007.¹⁹⁹

C.2.4.2. Practical initiatives by civil society and government

- [153]. Despite the fact that one million migrants live in Greece, the state does not have a permanently functional institution for teaching Greek language to adult migrants. In a few cases where such centres or schools do operate (usually at the universities), the participation requires migrants to have a residence permit and to deposit an amount of money that is for many immigrants rather large. This means that illegal and not well-off enough migrants are automatically excluded. The gap is frequently filled by volunteers (various groups and organisations) who set informal schools and teach Greek language to all migrants regardless of their place of origin and educational background.²⁰⁰
- [154]. Decision about the provision of more simple teaching material and examination papers - expected to be materialised by the end of 2007 - was taken by the Minister of Transportations and Communications in the beginning of Spring 2007, in order to facilitate Roma in their acquisition of the driving licence.²⁰¹
- [155]. Since 2003, teachers of an elementary school in Athens have been providing lessons of Greek language to migrant parents and of Albanian and Arabic languages to children. The results - according to the organisers - are positive, since the drop-out rate of migrants children is zero, conflicts between local (Greek) and migrant (Albanian) pupils have been reduced, there are no more phenomena of exclusion of migrant pupils who enrol for the first time, parents are able to communicate with teachers and participate in the school’s activities and in some cases in the parents’ association.²⁰²

198 <http://www.diavatrio.net/diavat/news.php?extend.1238>.
http://www.ideke.edu.gr/uploads/eem/prx_diag_semin.doc.

199 www.oloiisoι.gr www.alldifferent-allequal.info.

200 M. Bouziouri, Learning practical Greek, In: *Kathimerini* (18.02.2007)
www.ekathimerini.com/4dcgi/news/content.asp?aid=80390
www.olimazi.eu/?articleid=1629 (23/10/2007).

201 Μέτρο υπέρ αθιγγάνων για άδεια οδήγησης, In: *Kathimerini* (07.08.2007)
http://news.kathimerini.gr/4dcgi/_w_articles_ell_434419_07/08/2007_236926.

202 See annex 1

- [156]. The “Praksis” NGO provided education and leisure activities to - mainly Roma-children who work or solicit on streets.²⁰³
- [157]. Pupils of a high school in the island of Lesbos (NE Greece, near Turkey) conducted a research on racism and xenophobia.²⁰⁴

203 See annex 1

204 See annex 1

C.3. Housing

C.3.1. New complaints and monitoring bodies – differentiated data

- [158]. There is no new complaints mechanism or monitoring body to record and/or register complaints about discrimination in housing, nor are there any changes or administrative regulations allowing ‘ethnic’ data collection.

C.3.2. Racism and discrimination (incidents and practices)

C.3.2.1. Brief overview

- [159]. Year 2007 has been characterised by Roma evictions accompanied by local tensions related to housing and settling conditions of Roma families, as well as by important interventions of national, supranational and international human rights’ organisations. The later called for a greater accountability of the government and of local authorities in view of severe and ‘shocking’ violations of the rights of Roma (see below).
- [160]. The Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights Thomas Hammarberg addressed a letter in December 2006 (made public in 2007)²⁰⁵ to the Greek government regarding the evictions of Roma in Patras, and the aggressive and threatening attitudes of the non-Roma neighbours who disturbed his visit on site, underlining the lack of protection from the then present police force.²⁰⁶ An MP Nasos Alevras raised the issue of the Commissioner’s letter in a question before the Greek Parliament. In response, the Greek government indicated that

205 Thomas Hammarberg, Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights, *The situation of Roma in Greece*, Letter addressed to Mr Prokopis PAVLOPOULOS, Hellenic Minister for the Interior, Public Administration & Decentralisation (01.12.2006)

<https://wcd.coe.int/ViewDoc.jsp?id=1100661&BackColorInternet=FEC65B&BackColorIntranet=FEC65B&BackColorLogged=FFC679>

206 ‘I saw Roma families living in very poor conditions. Also, I met with a family whose simple habitat had been bulldozed away that same morning. It was obvious that the “procedures” for making them homeless were in total contradiction to human rights standards I referred to above. I was also disturbed to notice that non-Roma people appeared on both sites during my visit and behaved in an aggressive, threatening manner to the extent that my interviews with some of the Roma families were disturbed. I had expected that the police would have offered more obvious protection and I did not get the impression of a principled, clear position by the local authorities against such xenophobic, anti-Ziganistic tendencies.’

they had not answered the Commissioner's letter, because they did not possess 'adequate information.'²⁰⁷

- [161]. In April and May 2007 letters²⁰⁸ by the International Helsinki Federation (IHF) and the European Roma Rights Centre (ERRC) have been addressed to the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe, urging to adopt a recommendation on the continuous violation of Roma rights in Greece, and to persuade Greek authorities to investigate the related allegedly racist statements of the Deputy Prosecutor of the Supreme Court Mr. Anastasios Kanellopoulos.²⁰⁹
- [162]. The Centre on Housing Rights and Evictions in its 2007 report²¹⁰ compared the Roma evictions prior to the Athens 2004 Olympic Games to the situation in Beijing (Games 2008) and London (Games 2012). COHRE pointed out that since December 2006, when Greece won the COHRE's 2006 Housing Rights Violators award for its practice of forced evictions of Roma, no improvement has been documented.
- [163]. In its Annual Report 2006,²¹¹ published in March 2007, the equality body dealing with the cases of Roma housing – The Greek Ombudsman - exposed five relevant cases. With respect to the emergency of the issue of housing of pauperised Roma in Greece – among whom a large number of Roma populations from other Balkan countries - the key GO finding is that housing issue constitutes a foundation that all further structural exclusion from social life on local and national levels is built upon. The Ombudsman stresses that not only the impasse of the housing issue impedes any potential for personal and collective development and prosperity of the population in question, but that it also constitutes the main cause of their isolation and development of horizontal social tensions with local society and neighbouring population.
- [164]. The Ombudsman concludes that the administration is deprived of efficient legal tools to support positive action for social inclusion of the Roma community.

207 As described in the letter of ERRC to the Committee of Ministers, International Helsinki Federation press release (20.04.2007) *European Roma Rights Center, ERRC Urges Council of Europe Committee of Ministers to Adopt Roma-Related Recommendations to Greece*(17.05.2007) <http://www.errc.org/cikk.php?cikk=2758>

208 International Helsinki Federation press release (20.04.2007) *European Roma Rights Center, ERRC Urges Council of Europe Committee of Ministers to Adopt Roma-Related Recommendations to Greece*(17.05.2007) <http://www.errc.org/cikk.php?cikk=2758>

209 According to the European Parliamentary Assembly question AS (2007) CR 13 by Mr Cilevics to the Chairperson of the Committee of Ministers, relating to the situation of Roma in Patras, in early 2007 the Deputy Supreme Court Prosecutor allegedly justified the evictions and stated that "Patras should not be turned into a gypsie-town". <http://assembly.coe.int/Main.asp?link=/Documents/Records/2007/E/0704171500E.htm>

210 Centre on Housing Rights and Evictions, *Greece (and other countries): Housing Rights Abuses Challenged*, (11.06.2007), www.cohre.org.

211 The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

Since Roma housing issue is regulated by a Ministerial Decision about itinerant populations and public health²¹², what may lead to an efficient state policy and regulatory action is the reference to the Constitution and the European Convention of Human Rights as interpreted by the relevant Strasbourg Court and combined with the anti-discrimination law transposing the Race and Equality Directive.

- [165]. However, according to the Ombudsman, this objective may not be achieved without serious incentives to help mobilise local society stakeholders, organisations and the local administration itself.²¹³

C.3.2.2. Statistical data and tables on racist incidents

C.3.2.3. Exemplary cases

- [166]. In Jun 2007 a number of Roma families were evacuated from the Votanikos area near the centre of Athens by Greek authorities without any proper legal procedure and without providing them with alternative accommodation. The European Roma Rights Centre expressed its concern in a letter to the UN Special Rapporteur on the right to housing and to the Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights.²¹⁴ More information on the Votanikos eviction and the reaction of the Ombudsman (complaint no. 13986/2006)²¹⁵ is provided in chapters ‘Legal issues’ and ‘Racist violence’.
- [167]. In two cases²¹⁶ the Greek Ombudsman examined the reactions of neighbours to the Roma settlements in Lefkada. The GO undertook the role of the mediator with a twofold aim: to preserve the area of the historical monument and to ensure that the local authorities offer to the Roma special support as a group facing social exclusion. To this effect the GO claimed specifically the positive action option that the new Municipal and Communal Code provides for.²¹⁷

212 Ministerial Decision n. Γ.Π/23641, ΦΕΚ Β' 973/15.07.2003.

213 The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

214 European Roma Rights Centre (18.07.2007) www.errc.org/cikk.php?cikk=2849

215 The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf.

216 complaints nos. 13770/2006 & 2864/2006.

217 The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf. More information is provided in the chapter ‘Legal issues’

- [168]. The Ombudsman handled two cases²¹⁸ on long delays of the competent Department of the Municipalities to issue payment receipts for the Real Estate Tax paid, that needed to be used in drafting a real estate sales contract wherein the buyer would be Roma. Finally, the payment receipts were issued following the intervention of the GO.²¹⁹

C.3.2.4. Legal restrictions to access to housing

- [169]. There are no legal restrictions to housing for immigrants and minorities.

C.3.3. The situation of immigrants and minorities in housing

C.3.3.1. Brief overview

- [170]. According to data provided by the Ministry of Interior, the Roma housing through loans program is implemented at a slow pace and only a small proportion of the applications for housing loans have been approved and provided to the beneficiaries. According to the reformed legal framework, municipal councils are responsible for evaluating and approving the individual requests. A change of procedural rules and the adoption of an ongoing assessment of the implementation of the program and a continuous evaluation of its impact aim to improve its efficiency and facilitate achievement of the objectives.
- [171]. Up to the Jun 2006 deadline, 17.074 applications for Roma housing loans were submitted in 285 municipalities throughout Greece. In 2006 the Ministry of Interior distributed 1.835 loans to be assessed and approved by the local Municipal Councils, in charge of providing the final approval and granting the loan. Up to date, according to official information, the total number of housing support loans forwarded by the Ministry of Interior since the beginning of the program amounts to 8.600.²²⁰

218 Complaints 1956/2006 & 11255/2006.

219 The Greek Ombudsman, 2nd *Annual Report* as National Equality Body (2006), available at: http://www.synigoros.gr/diakriseis/pdfs/12_10_EqualTreatmentReport2006.pdf. More information is provided in the chapter 'Legal issues'.

220 Official response of the General Directorate of Development Programs of the Ministry of Interior n. 53949 and 53546/23.10.2007 to the data request of HLHR-KEMO (16.09.2007).

C.3.3.2. Statistical data and tables on the housing situation of migrants and minorities

- [172]. In the Annex 7, official statistical data and tables on applications and approvals of Roma housing loans are presented.
- [173]. There is no other available data on housing in general, or on types of tenure, occupation density, conditions, expenditures, homelessness etc.
- [174]. However, research on the most valid available data on a national level (2001 National Census) indicates specific patterns and differentiation in housing conditions among immigrant groups and natives (see below).

C.3.3.3. Segregation and neighbourhood integration

- [175]. A number of researches suggest that in major urban complexes such as Athens, social inequalities have been accentuated by the inflow of immigrants and that there is a visible threat of segregation in housing.²²¹
- [176]. A 2001 National Census data based research²²² investigating the fact that the urban space of Athens is not characterized by a visible or a ‘hard’-type segregation of immigrants, pointed out the unequal spatial residential distribution of immigrants and a “soft” and selective segregation dominant pattern. A research paper²²³ focuses on the links between segregation of immigrants and processes of urban development in southern European cities with particular focus on Athens. The paper concludes that, although Athens can be considered as one of the most plural Southern European metropolises, new forms of centralised and decentralised socio-ethnic segregation have emerged. According to the research, Athens is ‘turning outside-in’, since the centre draws immigrants into its zone.²²⁴ However, significant differences exist amongst

221 Harami Stella, Ανανέωση από τους μετανάστες, In: *Eleftheros Tipos* (08.06.2007) <http://diavatirio.net/diavat/news.1070>

222 Vasilis Arapoglou, *In-group divisions of immigrants in Athens and policies of their management*, paper presented at the Minority Group Research Centre’ s conference (15/12/06 -17/12/06)

223 Vassilis P. Arapoglou, Immigration, segregation and urban development in Athens: the relevance of the LA debate for southern European Metropolises in: *The Greek Review of Social Research*, special issue 121, Ca 2006, pp.11-38

224 Vassilis P. Arapoglou, Immigration, segregation and urban development in Athens: the relevance of the LA debate for southern European Metropolises in: *The Greek Review of Social Research*, special issue 121, Ca 2006, pp.11-38: ‘A spatial pattern of both centralised and decentralised forms of segregation is emerging. Although the Athenian space is still dominated by heavy concentration of service jobs and population in the central city there are significant trends for suburbanisation and sprawling. Immigrants are more centralised than Greeks, although different patterns are shaped for different ethnic and occupational groups.’ (p.30).

immigrants of different origin and nationality. On the one hand, Albanian nationals appear to share residential space with Greeks and, given that they constitute the largest proportion of the total immigrant population, their capacity to spread across large city areas contributes to overall low segregation levels. On the other hand, immigrants from central and eastern European and from less developed Asian and African countries tend to concentrate in smaller, communities.²²⁵ Although ‘Athens has to be considered as one of the most diverse and plural European metropolises’, segregation tendencies do exist.²²⁶

- [177]. Important systematic differentiations in housing are observed in relation to the age of the dwellings, the floor of habitation and the housing density, especially in the centre of Athens. Some claim that social segregation is expected to increase due to the absence of political planning concerning the creation of socially homogeneous areas at the suburbs and the immigrants’ housing.²²⁷
- [178]. A research conducted by the Athens Polytechnic suggests that immigrants, renting or purchasing underground or lower floors or basement apartments in older buildings that would otherwise remain vacant, have contributed to a major boost of central Athens degraded neighbourhoods and to the previously stagnated real estate market. Segregation is not realized at the neighbourhood level but in the apartment floors they rent or purchase. Ghettos in the sense of isolation and separation from natives do not seem to exist in Athens. ‘This is what sets Athens apart from other European cities.’²²⁸

225 Vassilis P. Arapoglou, Immigration, segregation and urban development in Athens: the relevance of the LA debate for southern European Metropolises in: *The Greek Review of Social Research*, special issue 121, Ca 2006, pp.11-38, p.29.

226 Vassilis P. Arapoglou (2006), Immigration, segregation and urban development in Athens: the relevance of the LA debate for southern European Metropolises in: *The Greek Review of Social Research*, special issue 121, Ca 2006, pp.11-38: ‘(They) are most evident for the upper managerial and the lower unskilled occupations of the foreign population’.(p.29-30)

227 Harami Stella, Ανανέωση από τους μετανάστες, In: *Eleftheros Tipos* (08.06.2007) <http://diavatirio.net/diavat/news.1070>

228 Dina Vaiou, Fotini Tounta (2007), unpublished research conducted by the Athens Polytechnic University. Reported by: Kathy Tzilivakis, Immigrants as urban saviours, New research suggests that immigration is a key component of neighbourhood transformation and urban renewal in Athens, Article code: C13241A141, In: *Athens News* (29.06.2007). According to the researchers, immigrants have changed the face of Athens introducing diversity and new businesses in previously abandoned neighbourhoods. The ethnic clusters mapped by the research are not considered ghettos because immigrants are not isolated from the mainstream city.

C.3.4. Good practice

C.3.4.1. Policy initiatives

- [179]. The National Strategy Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion 2006-2008²²⁹ serves to ‘avoid territorial segregation between immigrants (and other groups with cultural/religious particularities) and the rest of the population through preventive actions, such as to improve living conditions in urban areas where these groups mainly concentrate, to resolve housing problems and to facilitate their displacement within the territory.’²³⁰ However, the National Strategy Plan Evaluation observes that ‘given the scarcity of evaluations of the impact of the implemented measures, and knowing that in reality a lot remains to be done to adequately address the issue of improving the situation of Greek Roma, to consider this specific intervention a good practice seems debatable.’²³¹

C.3.4.2. Practical initiatives by civil society and government

- [180]. Among other civil society activities, the NGO PRAKSIS provides housing to migrants. Within the ‘Roof B’ project (Στέγη Β), PRAKSIS provides temporary housing to asylum seekers and refugees.²³²

229 Ministry of Employment and Social Protection, *National Strategy Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion 2006-2008* (September 2006)

230 Ministry of Employment and Social Protection, *National Strategy Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion 2006-2008* (September 2006), p.38. The Integrated Action Program for Roma housing, implemented under an Interministerial Committee supervision coordinated by the Minister of Interior, Public Administration and Decentralization, is also provided by the National Plan for Social Inclusion.

231 Commission of the European Communities SEC(2007) 272/22.02.2007, *COMMISSION STAFF WORKING DOCUMENT Joint Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion COUNTRY PROFILES – Greece* p.74

232 See annex 1

C.4. Health and social care

C.4.1. New complaints and monitoring bodies – differentiated data

[181]. There is no specialised public or non-governmental body that records complaints or allegations of racism and/or discrimination regarding health and social care affecting migrants and minorities, nor any development regarding the collection of related data. However, people may submit complaints on discrimination in the area of health and social care and on matters of access to health and care provisions to the Greek Ombudsman, which apart from a generic Ombudsman is the quality Body in Greece for discrimination in the public sector. The Health Ombudsman's generic mission is also implemented by a Deputy Greek Ombudsman.

C.4.2. Racism and discrimination (incidents and practices)

C.4.2.1. Brief overview

- [182]. There are no discrimination, racist or xenophobic incidents reported either by official or unofficial sources.
- [183]. However, the discrimination cases on Roma housing and settling handled by the Greek Ombudsman as Equality Body, do have an aspect related to public health and to health and social care provisions to Roma communities.²³³
- [184]. Moreover, the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CPT) and the European Parliament Committee on Civil Liberties, Justice and Home Affairs and UNHCR-Greece underlined in their reports the emergency of inhumane hygienic conditions of the detention centres for third country nationals, especially in the Aegean sea islands and the lack of access of detained migrants and refugees to health and social care provisions.²³⁴

233 These cases are presented in the chapters 'A. Legal issues' and 'C.3 Housing'.

234 The reports are referred thoroughly in chapter B.Racist violence.

C.4.2.2. Statistical data and tables on racist incidents

- [185]. There are no available statistical data on racist incidents in the area of health and social care.

C.4.2.3. Exemplary cases

- [186]. In racism and discrimination cases related to Roma settling, issues of public health and problems of access to health and social care services emerge.²³⁵

C.4.2.4. Additional information

- [187]. In Greece, access to medical care for irregular immigrants, who constitute a large number of third country nationals residing in Greece, is allowed only in urgent emergency cases.²³⁶ Moreover, according to surveys, practical obstacles and lack of awareness limit their access to health and social care system (see below).

C.4.3. The situation of immigrants and minorities in health

- [188]. The final report of a comparative European survey²³⁷ of ‘Medecins du Monde’ and its ‘European Observatory for Access to Health’ on the access of immigrants without regular stay permit to medical care was published on 25.09.2007. The Report examined seven EU member-states (Belgium, Spain, Greece, France, Italy, Portugal, and UK). The comparative findings show that irregular immigrants have a theoretical access to health services in 78% of cases throughout the European countries in question. Greece is the member state where only 6,9% of the sample (the lowest among the survey’s countries) has theoretical legal access to medical care, and where the 84% of the sample (the highest) is unaware of its rights to health services in general (40%) such as the option to perform a free-of-charge HIV test for instance.

235 These cases are presented in the chapters ‘A. Legal issues’ and ‘C.3 Housing’.

236 The art.84.1 of the migration bill (law n.3386/2005) obliges public officers and hospital staff not to provide services to irregular immigrants unless they are hospitalised urgently or they are minors. The latter exception is an amendment proposed by the Ombudsman for the Children in 2005.

237 Medecins du Monde, First European Observatory on Access to Medical Care (2007), ‘Without papers, without health?’, *European Survey about the access of immigrants without regular stay permit to medical care*, (25.09.2007.), http://www.mdmgreece.gr/pdf/070925_paratiritiro.pdf, http://www.mdmgreece.gr/pdf/070925_full_report.pdf

- [189]. A psychological research²³⁸ indicated that depression and stress symptoms along with other psychological disorders are on the rise among immigrants - particularly Albanians - in Greece. In a comparative study of a sample of 404 immigrants and 373 Greeks residing in Athens and Messinia (Peloponnesus region) performed by the prof. Anastasia Asizi Kalantzi and the Dr Efrosini Spanea, one of the findings shows that 37% of Albanian and 29% of Bulgarian immigrants have manifested depression symptoms, with the respective percentage for Greeks being only 14,6%.²³⁹
- [190]. A research about the psychological adaptation of immigrant children was presented at the World Paediatric Congress, held in Athens in August 2007.²⁴⁰ With the theme 'Bilingual / multilingual children in Greece - Adaptation and psychological difficulties', the research was carried out by the First Paediatric and the Ophthalmologic Clinic at the University of Athens. The sample, composed mainly of Albanian children (58%) and children of the East European countries' (21%) - most of them bilingual and up to 12% multilingual - did not face any serious problems of sleep and did not manifest fearful or phobic attitude towards school. The researchers emphasised that the majority of the children were regularly vaccinated and that they were living in Greece for the last 6-9 years.

C.4.4. Good practice

C.4.4.1. Policy initiatives

- [191]. The National Strategy plan provides targeted health and social care services to different groups of migrants and minorities. The 'Mosaic' centre run by the 'Centre of Therapy of Addicted Persons' (KETHEA) implements one of the most notable co-funded activities for health and social care provisions to

238 Efrosini Spanea, Anastasia Kalantzi-Azizi (2007), *Ψυχοκοινωνικοί παράγοντες, διαδικασία επιπολιτισμού και ψυχική υγεία σε οικονομικούς μετανάστες από την Αλβανία και την Βουλγαρία στην Ελλάδα*, Department of Civic status, aliens and migration of Messinia Prefecture, University of Athens. Reported also: Kiriakatiki Eleftherotipia, (29.07.2007) www.enet.gr/online/online_text/c=112,dt=29.07.2007,id=1155496

239 Additionally, immigrants mostly risk to experience psychological distress, the oldest their age when they migrated to Greece, the less children they have, less support by family and friends and the less resilient they declare to be. Respectively, according to the research, less years of education, female sex, residence in Athens and less social support by family and friends are decisive factors for depression symptoms. Efrosini Spanea, Anastasia Kalantzi-Azizi (2007), *Ψυχοκοινωνικοί παράγοντες, διαδικασία επιπολιτισμού και ψυχική υγεία σε οικονομικούς μετανάστες από την Αλβανία και την Βουλγαρία στην Ελλάδα*, Department of Civic status, aliens and migration of Messinia Prefecture, University of Athens.

240 Eleftherotipia, (31.08.2007), www.enet.gr/online/online_text/c=112,dt=31.08.2007,id=30352120

migrants and refugees.²⁴¹ In the context of the “Integrated Action Plan on Gypsies”, actions aiming at the safeguarding and promotion of health, as well as at their social inclusion are implemented. Among these, the Medico-social Centres provide prevention, basic first-level health, first-level social care and the mobile units conduct clinical examinations and vaccinations.²⁴² The Disease Control and Prevention Centre (KEELPNO) implements a number of actions for the ‘promotion and safeguard of public health of special population groups’, among which migrants, refugees, ethnic and cultural minorities.²⁴³

C.4.4.2. Practical initiatives by civil society and government

[192]. The NGO ‘PRAKSIS’²⁴⁴ implements a number of health and social care projects addressing migrants and minorities.²⁴⁵

241 ‘In order to protect female victims of trafficking, educational programs and development aid actions have been implemented in cooperation with the countries of origin of immigrants and trafficking victims. The two counselling centres (Athens and Piraeus) of the General Secretariat for Equality mentioned above, provide care to female victims of violence, as well as advice, psychological and legal support’. ‘To assist and protect immigrants, refugees and the repatriated from the risk of addictive substances, a special program (MOSAIC) runs by the Therapy Centre for Dependent Individuals (KETHEA) in the framework of the National Action Plan against drugs, supported by volunteers. For Greek Muslims a new cross-cultural program is implemented in Thrace (Kivotos).’ Ministry of Employment and Social Protection, *National Strategy Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion 2006-2008* (September 2006), p.26.

242 ‘Actions are implemented in order to record the target group and its needs, promote health and information on public health issues, connect these population groups with social welfare programs and provide education, employment promotion services etc., as well as to arrange them at urban municipal level, make them familiar with new housing data and provide consultation on the integration of the family and particularly of children into society. Moreover, actions are implemented to raise the awareness of the local population on the cultural particularities of the target group, the problems, needs and their possible solutions. As to the supporting services provided by the Centres, it should be noted that they do not aim at replacing existing structures. Their character is that of referring and advising gypsies and playing the role of a mediator, in order to make gypsies familiar with the structures of the National Health and Social Care System and other local structures (Employment Promotion Centres (KPA), decentralized public services, local government, NGOs etc.), so that they can make use of the available services they need. The creation of 37 centres is envisaged. Since 2005 18 centres have already started operating’ ‘As a complement to the forenamed actions and particularly in order to cover the needs of gypsies living in semi-nomad, nomad or remote communities, mobile units are implemented by the Ministry of Health and Social Solidarity with the participation of Health Directorates of Prefectures, the Administrations of Health Care Regions (DYPE), the National Social Solidarity Centre (EKKA) and the Disease Control and Prevention Centre (KEELPNO).’ Ministry of Employment and Social Protection, *National Strategy Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion 2006-2008* (September 2006), pp.36.-37.

243 Official document n.8634/09.10.2007 addressed to HLHR-KEMO.

244 The main objectives of PRAKSIS are the design and the implementation of humanitarian and medical activities to meet the specific needs of socially excluded groups, among which immigrants and ethnic minorities. PRAKSIS health and social care activities are ‘Multi-

- [193]. The NGO ‘Medecins du Monde’ – Greece implements a number of health and social care projects addressing migrants and minorities, and it participates in the network of the ‘European Observatory for Access to Health’.²⁴⁶

Medical’ centres of Athens and Thessalonica, Centres for information and support of immigrants of Athens and Thessalonica, Public health Athens and Thessalonica.

245 See annex 1

246 See annex 1

Conclusions

- Year 2007 is marked by a number of significant developments. Despite the increase in the occurrence and intensity of the discrimination cases and violent incidents against migrants and minorities, data collection and reporting is absent. No racist crime has been recorded as such by the police, even when reported widely by the media and unofficial sources. The most indicative example is the YouTube video that showed torture and humiliation of young immigrants by police officers. It circulated in the Greek and international media in mid-2007 but it did not lead to any investigation of racist motivation of the perpetrators. Another development is a number of trials for anti-Semitism and hate speech against Roma, indicating the implementation of the anti-racist law for the first time in Greece, which in 2007 was condemned by the European Court for Human Rights in four cases for ill-treatment and police brutality against immigrants.
- Despite an elaborated National Strategy Plan for Social Inclusion and Integration, criticised for failing to meet its objectives at the evaluation stage, and an increased number of actions to promote integration, the situation of migrants and minorities is reported as difficult and/or critical.
- The long term residence directive is practically not implemented and Greek migration policy is ranked among the least favourable, compared to other EU countries, especially with respect to political participation and citizenship policies. Only less than half a million of immigrants hold a valid residence permit, most workers are employed undeclared, and they often live in precarious housing conditions. Their residence patterns vary from urban ethnic cluster housing to makeshift shacks in rural Greece, although there is still no evidence of urban segregation. Legal restriction to access to health and social care by the large number of irregularly residing immigrants leads to one of the lower rates of access to medical care in the EU.
- Evictions without offering alternative housing solutions and violent incidents against Roma, among which burning of a Roma-only school after an arson attack, mark one more difficult year for Roma in Greece. They are followed by the intense interest and intervention of supranational and international human rights organisations and institutions. Data demonstrate the inefficiency of state policies to deal with the needs of Roma and with the intolerant behaviour towards them either on a local or a national level.
- However, facing these realities, the advocacy and intervention of civil society organisations appear strong and a number of positive initiatives, often supported by EU funds and by the state, make a visible impact filling the gaps of anti-discrimination policy. This, combined with an increase of relevant research and surveys conducted, is of great significance for a country that is ranked among the EU countries with the least favourable policies and with the most negative persisting attitudes about immigrants and minorities.

Annex 1 – Positive initiatives

Area:	Racist Violence
Title (original language)	12 ^ο Αντιρατσιστικό Φεστιβάλ Αθήνας
Title (EN)	12 th Athens Antiracist Festival
Organisation (original language)	Δίκτυο Κοινωνικής Υποστήριξης Προσφύγων και Μεταναστών
Organisation (EN)	Network for Social Support of Immigrants and Refugees
Government / Civil society	Civil society
Internet link	www.tsamadou13.gr
Type of initiative	cultural activity, intercultural dialogue,
Main target group	general public, women, migrants, asylum seekers, refugees, religious minorities, youth (children, young people, students), ethnic minorities, victims of racist violence
Brief description (max. 1000 chars)	The Antiracist festival gathers most immigrant communities and NGOs dealing with immigrants and minority issues, migration policy, racism and racist violence and intolerance, discrimination, intercultural dialogue and education. It is a widely known event organised every year. An exceptionally large number of immigrants' communities and associations, as well as NGOs and civil society stakeholders cooperate in its implementation and attracts thousands of Greek citizens, mostly young people, to its live concerts, public discussions, ethnic and cultural events and bazaars.

Area:	Racist Violence
Title (original language)	Αντιρατσιστική Εβδομάδα All different-All equal
Title (EN)	Antiracist Week - All different-All equal
Organisation (original language)	Εθνικό Συμβούλιο Νεολαίας - Γενική Γραμματεία Νέας Γενιάς
Organisation (EN)	National Youth Council - General Secretariat for the Young Generation
Government / Civil society	Government
Internet link	www.esyn.gr - www.neagenia.gr
Type of initiative	cultural activity, intercultural dialogue, awareness raising,
Main target group	general public, migrants, asylum seekers, refugees, religious minorities, youth (children, young people, students), ethnic minorities
Brief description (max. 1000 chars)	With the occasion of the European Anti-Racist Week (14-21.03.2007) and within the framework of the anti-racism campaign in Greece ‘all different-all equal’, events were held in major Greek cities of Athens and Thessalonica. The events promoted by the Council of Europe aiming at combating racism and xenophobia were organised by the National Youth Council and supported by the General Secretariat for the Young Generation and NGOs. They included art and graffiti happenings, documentaries, photography exhibitions, juggling shows, body-painting workshops and theatrical performances in public spaces like the Metro stations and open squares.

Area:	Racist Violence
Title (original language)	Συναυλία υποστήριξης της οικογένειας του Tony Onouha
Title (EN)	Concert for the support of Tony Onouha's family
Organisation (original language)	Κοινότητα Νιγηριανών – Φόρουμ Μεταναστών – Αντιρατσιστική Πρωτοβουλία Θεσσαλονίκης
Organisation (EN)	Nigerian Community - Forum of Migrants - Antiracist Initiative of Thessalonica
Government / Civil society	Civil society
Internet link	
Type of initiative	cultural activity, support, advice to immigrants/minorities
Main target group	general public, victims of racist violence
Brief description (max. 1000 chars)	Tony Onouha, the Nigerian itinerant street vendor lost his life when jumping from the first floor of the cafe, while fleeing from two plainclothes policeman. The Nigerian Community, the Forum of Migrants and the Antiracist Initiative of Thessalonica organised a solidarity concert to raise funds for the transportation of his corps and to cover the funeral expenses of his family.

Area:	Racist Violence
Title (original language)	On-line Φόρμες κατά των διακρίσεων: ΘΕΤΙΚΕΣ ΠΡΩΤΟΒΟΥΛΙΕΣ & ΚΑΛΕΣ ΠΡΑΚΤΙΚΕΣ ΚΑΤΑ ΤΩΝ ΔΙΑΚΡΙΣΕΩΝ & ΠΕΡΙΣΤΑΤΙΚΑ ΡΑΤΣΙΣΤΙΚΗΣ ΒΙΑΣ
Title (EN)	Online anti-discrimination forms: ‘Positive initiatives and good practices against discrimination’ & ‘Racist Violence Incidents’
Organisation (original language)	HLHR-KEMO (ΕΕΔΑ-ΚΕΜΟ) Εθνικό Παρατηρητήριο για το Ρατσισμό και την Ξενοφοβία
Organisation (EN)	HLHR-KEMO National Focal Point on Racism and Xenophobia
Government / Civil society	Civil society
Internet link	www.hlhr.gr/hlhr-kemo/hlhr-kemo.htm
Type of initiative	awareness raising, support, advice to immigrants/minorities,
Main target group	general public, victims of racist violence, ethnic minorities , Roma and Travellers, migrants, asylum seekers, refugees, religious minorities, teachers, public authorities, employers and their associations, employees and their associations
Brief description (max. 1000 chars)	The HLHR-KEMO RAXEN National Focal Point has elaborated and disseminated online anti-discrimination forms to NGOs, civil society organisations and stakeholders, as well as to the wider public, in order to facilitate and increase the validity and credibility of reporting of racist violence incidents and of good practices related to combating discrimination and racism. The respective forms were also distributed to the competent public administration services within the framework of networking and data collection for RAXEN 2007.

Area:	Racist Violence, Employment, Housing, Health and Social Care
Title (original language)	ΠΡΟΓΡΑΜΜΑΤΑ ΑΘΗΝΑΣ & ΘΕΣΣΑΛΟΝΙΚΗΣ
Title (EN)	ATHENS & THESSALONICA PROGRAMS
Organisation (original language)	PRAKSIS
Organisation (EN)	PRAKSIS
Government / Civil society	Civil society (NGO)
Internet link	www.praksis.gr
Type of initiative	awareness raising, support, advice to immigrants/minorities, legal advocacy, training, education, awards, grants, community cohesion – social integration, codes of ethics, code of conduct, improving employment skills
Main target group	general public, victims of racist violence, youth (children, young people, students), women, elderly, ethnic minorities, Roma and Travellers, migrants, asylum seekers, refugees, religious minorities, teachers, public authorities, police
Brief description (max. 1000 chars)	The NGO PRAKSIS implements a number of projects addressing migrants and minorities, by providing holistic and multiple support of legal, labour counselling and advocacy, medical and psychological services, as well as by awareness-raising, and empowering of vulnerable groups. The main objectives of PRAKSIS are the design and the implementation of humanitarian and medical activities for the specific needs of socially excluded groups, among which immigrants and ethnic minorities. The self-implemented activities of PRAKSIS are ‘Multi-Medical’ centres of Athens and Thessalonica, Centres for information and support of immigrants of Athens and Thessalonica, Public health Athens and Thessalonica.

Area:	Racist Violence
Title (original language)	ΠΡΟΣΔΙΟΡΙΣΜΟΣ ΤΩΝ ΑΠΑΡΑΙΤΗΤΩΝ ΔΡΑΣΕΩΝ ΑΣΦΑΛΕΙΑΣ ΤΗΣ ΕΛΛΗΝΙΚΗΣ ΑΣΤΥΝΟΜΙΑΣ ΓΙΑ ΤΗ ΣΤΗΡΙΞΗ ΕΙΔΙΚΩΝ ΠΛΗΘΥΣΜΙΑΚΩΝ ΟΜΑΔΩΝ
Title (EN)	Definition of necessary security actions of the Greek Police for the Support of Special Population Groups
Organisation (original language)	Intraway σε συνεργασία με την Ελληνική Αστυνομία
Organisation (EN)	Intraway in cooperation with the Greek Police
Government / Civil society	Government / private synergy
Internet link	www.intraway.gr
Type of initiative	Research
Main target group	Elderly, ethnic minorities, Roma and Travellers, migrants, asylum seekers, refugees
Brief description (max. 1000 chars)	The Greek Police has assigned to the private sector research agency (Intraway) to perform a research regarding the specific needs for police protection, treatment and support of special population groups, among which ethnic minorities, Roma and Travellers, migrants, asylum seekers and refugees.

Area:	Education
Title (original language)	ΕΝΑ ΣΧΟΛΕΙΟ ΔΕΙΧΝΕΙ ΤΟ ΔΡΟΜΟ ΓΙΑ ΤΗΝ ΕΝΤΑΞΗ ΤΩΝ ΑΛΛΟΓΛΩΣΣΩΝ ΜΑΘΗΤΩΝ
Title (EN)	A school shows the way for the integration of the pupils having mother tongue other than Greek.
Organisation (original language)	132 ΔΗΜΟΤΙΚΟ ΣΧΟΛΕΙΟ ΑΘΗΝΩΝ (ΣΧΟΛΙΚΟ ΣΥΓΚΡΟΤΗΜΑ ΓΚΡΑΒΑΣ) - Ομάδα “Πίσω Θρανία”
Organisation (EN)	132 nd Elementary School of Athens (Grava School cluster) - The “Back desks” group
Government / Civil society	Civil society (action accepted and partly supported by the government)
Internet link	
Type of initiative	Education, support, advice to immigrants and minorities , community cohesion – social integration, intercultural dialogue
Main target group	Youth, migrants
Brief description (max. 1000 chars)	Since the year 2003, teachers of an elementary school in Athens (with 190 pupils, 110 of whom are children of migrants, mostly from Albania) provide lessons of Greek language to migrant parents, and lessons of Albanian and Arabic languages to their children. This is the only school in Greece with regular classes of this kind. The reaction of the state varied between negative to neutral. The positive results, according to the organisers, consist of the following: The drop-out rate of migrants children reaches 0, conflicts between local (Greek) and migrant (Albanian) pupils have been reduced, there are no more phenomena of exclusion of migrant pupils who enrol for the first time, parents are able to communicate with teachers and take part in the school’s activities, and in some cases in the parents’ associations.

Area:	Education
Title (original language)	ΠΡΟΓΡΑΜΜΑΤΑ ΑΘΗΝΑΣ & ΘΕΣΣΑΛΟΝΙΚΗΣ
Title (EN)	ATHENS & THESSALONICA PROGRAMS
Organisation (original language)	ΠΡΑΞΙΣ
Organisation (EN)	PRAKSIS
Government / Civil society	NGO
Internet link	www.praksis.gr
Type of initiative	training, education, awareness raising, support, advice to immigrants/minorities, legal advocacy, awards, grants, community cohesion – social integration, codes of ethics, code of conduct, improving employment skills
Main target group	general public, youth (children, young people, students), women, elderly, ethnic minorities, Roma and travellers, migrants, asylum seekers, refugees, religious minorities, teachers, public authorities, police, victims of racist violence
Brief description (max. 1000 chars)	Provision of education and leisure activities to - mainly Roma - children who work or solicit on streets. During 2006, 348 such children were located and approached by PRAKSIS experts. Main actions taken were: contact with parents; provision of information and advice; provision of psychological support to parents and children; facilitation of enrolment and school attendance (25 children enrolled, 10 graduated); provision of health education and support (19 children).

Area:	Education
Title (original language)	EPEYNA: PATΣIΣMOΣ - ΞΕΝΟΦΟΒΙΑ
Title (EN)	Research : Racism - Xenophobia
Organisation (original language)	2ο ΓΥΜΝΑΣΙΟ ΜΥΤΙΛΗΝΗΣ
Organisation (EN)	2 nd High school (gymnasium) of Mitilini
Government / Civil society	Civil society (action accepted and partly supported by government)
Internet link	mail@2gym-mytil.les.sch.gr
Type of initiative	training, education, community cohesion – social integration, intercultural dialogue, codes of ethics, code of conduct
Main target group	general public, youth (children, young people, students), teachers
Brief description (max. 1000 chars)	Research conducted by high school pupils with target group teenager pupils, during the school year 2005-06 (presented in 2007). Main findings: Greek pupils, in vast majority, associate with migrant pupils, but do not form closer relations; most of the pupils accept the attendance of foreign children in Greek schools as normal; pupils with different religion (other than Christian-Orthodox) are accepted with difficulty, especially Muslims and atheists; there is a negative attitude towards Albanians and Turks; main source of information and thus the main factor responsible for the creation of the negative attitudes towards migrants is Media.

Area:	Employment, Education, Housing, Health and Social Care
Title (original language)	Εθνικό Σχέδιο Δράσης για την Κοινωνική Ένταξη
Title (EN)	The National Strategy Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion 2006-2008
Organisation (original language)	Υπουργείο Απασχόλησης
Organisation (EN)	Ministry of Employment (Coordinator of Interministerial Committee)
Government / Civil society	Government
Internet link	http://ec.europa.eu/employment_social/social_inclusion/docs/2006/nap/greece_en.pdf
Type of initiative	awareness raising, support, advice to immigrants/minorities, training, education, community cohesion – social integration, improving employment skills, Holocaust education, cultural activity, intercultural dialogue
Main target group	general public, youth (children, young people, students), women, elderly, ethnic minorities, Roma and Travellers, migrants, asylum seekers, refugees, religious minorities, teachers, public authorities, employers and their associations, employees and their associations
Brief description (max. 1000 chars)	The National Strategy Report on Social Protection and Social Inclusion 2006-2008 provides a framework of actions for people with disabilities and immigrants. The focus is on the social and work inclusion, in order to ‘help to enhance social cohesion and to achieve economic growth and employment by drastically increasing their employment and income rates.’ The plan also aims to ‘avoid territorial segregation between immigrants (and other groups with cultural/religious particularities) and the rest of the population, through preventive actions, such as to improve living conditions in urban areas where these groups mainly concentrate, to resolve housing problems and to facilitate their displacement within the territory.’ The Integrated plan for Roma housing and the multiannual programs for integration of Muslims and Immigrant children in schools, as well as public health and medico-social centres addressing mostly Roma minority are implemented under the National Action Plan for social inclusion.

Area:	Health and Social Care
Title (original language)	Παρατηρητήριο για την πρόσβαση στην Περίθαλψη
Title (EN)	Observatory for Access to medical Care of the network of MDM's 'European Observatory for Access to Health'
Organisation (original language)	Γιατροί του Κόσμου
Organisation (EN)	Medecins du Monde'
Government / Civil society	Civil society
Internet link	www.mdmgreece.gr
Type of initiative	awareness raising, support, advice to immigrants/minorities, training, education, community cohesion – social integration, improving employment skills, Holocaust education, cultural activity, intercultural dialogue
Main target group	general public, youth (children, young people, students), women, elderly, ethnic minorities, Roma and Travellers, migrants, asylum seekers, refugees, religious minorities, teachers, public authorities, employers and their associations, employees and their associations
Brief description (max. 1000 chars)	The NGO 'Medecins du Monde' – Greece implements a number of projects addressed to migrants and minorities concerning health and social care and participates at the network of the 'European Observatory for Access to Health'.

Area:	Health and Social Care
Title (original language)	Mosaic
Title (EN)	Mosaic
Organisation (original language)	Κέντρο Θεραπείας Εξαρτημένων Ατόμων
Organisation (EN)	Therapy Centre for Dependent Individuals (KETHEA)
Government / Civil society	Civil society – funded by the government
Internet link	http://www.kethea.gr/pub/Category.asp?lang=gr&catid=49
Type of initiative	support, advice to immigrants/minorities, training, education, cultural activity, intercultural dialogue
Main target group	victims of racist violence, youth (children, young people, students), women, elderly, ethnic minorities, migrants, asylum seekers, refugees
Brief description (max. 1000 chars)	The centre ‘Mosaic’ run by the Therapy Centre for Dependent Individuals (KETHEA) implements one of the most notable co-funded programs for health and social care provisions to migrants and refugees. Its aim is to assist and protect immigrants, refugees and the repatriated from the risk of addictive substances in the framework of the National Action Plan against drugs, supported by volunteers.

Area:	Health and Social Care
Title (original language)	Προαγωγή και Διασφάλιση της Δημόσιας Υγείας σε Ειδικές Ομάδες Πληθυσμού
Title (EN)	Promotion and Safeguard of Public Health of Special Population Groups
Organisation (original language)	Κέντρο Ελέγχου και Πρόληψης Νοσημάτων (ΚΕ.ΕΛ.ΠΝ.ΝΟ.) – Υπουργείο Υγείας & Κοινωνικής Αλληλεγγύης
Organisation (EN)	Disease Control and Prevention Centre (KEELPNO) – Ministry of Health and Social Solidarity
Government / Civil society	Government
Internet link	www.keelpno.gr
Type of initiative	support, advice to immigrants/minorities, training, education, community cohesion – social integration, improving employment skills
Main target group	women, elderly, ethnic minorities, migrants, asylum seekers, refugees
Brief description (max. 1000 chars)	The Disease Control and Prevention Centre (KEELPNO) implements a number of actions for the ‘promotion and safeguard of public health of special population groups’, among which migrants, refugees, ethnic and cultural minorities. As a complement to the forenamed actions and particularly in order to cover the needs of gypsies living in semi-nomad, nomad or remote communities, mobile units are implemented by the Ministry of Health and Social Solidarity with the participation of Health Directorates of Prefectures, the Administrations of Health Care Regions (DYPE), the National Social Solidarity Centre (EKKA) and the Disease Control and Prevention Centre (KEELPNO).

Annex 2a – Statistics court/tribunal/special body cases and decisions on ethnic discrimination

Table 1 - Complaints handled by the Greek Ombudsman	2005	2006
Total complaints under the anti-discrimination law 3304/2005	22	51
Complaints for discrimination on other grounds	12	29
Complaints under the Racial Equality Directive	10	22
Established racial or ethnic discrimination (founded complaints)	4	8
<i>Cases handled - Areas of application</i>		
ethnic/racial discrimination in employment and working conditions	2	8
ethnic/racial discrimination in vocational training	0	0
ethnic/racial discrimination in education	1	5
ethnic/racial discrimination in participation to trade unions	0	0
ethnic/racial discrimination in social protection, health, security	0	0
ethnic/racial discrimination in social welfare and services	0	0
ethnic/racial discrimination in access to goods and services	7	9

Source: *The Greek Ombudsman*.

Table - 2

**Outcome of complaints for discrimination on grounds of race / ethnic origin
handled by the Greek Ombudsman**

	2005	2006
Unfounded complaints - discrimination not established	3	7
Compliance - cases resolved	1	1
Non compliance	0	0
Pending	6	13
Reference for disciplinary action	0	0
Reference to the prosecutor for penal action	0	0
Cases closed for inadmissibility	2	1

Source: *The Greek Ombudsman*.

Annex 2b – Statistics court cases criminal law

[194]. Not available.

Annex 2c – Court, specialised body or tribunal decisions

Case title	Professional qualifications of a lawyer
Decision date	2007 (complaint no. 3833/2006)
Reference details (type and title of court/body; in original language and English [official translation, if available])	Συνήγορος του Πολίτη, Φορέας Προώθησης της Αρχής της Ίσης Μεταχείρισης [Greek Ombudsman, National Equality Body]
Key facts of the case (max. 500 chars)	A female, foreign born, naturalised Greek citizen under her capacity as an assistant lawyer (trainee), asked the Ministry of Justice to confirm that the provision in the Greek Lawyers' Code according to which "a foreign born person who has acquired the Greek citizenship through naturalization cannot be appointed as a lawyer until after five years have passed since his/her naturalization" is no longer in force after the recent anti-discrimination legislation (Law 3304/2005). The Ministry responded in a negative way.
Main reasoning/argumentation (max. 500 chars)	The only exception allowed by the anti-discrimination legislation is the discrimination on the grounds of citizenship, which is not the case when Greek citizens in their own country are not allowed to exercise the profession of lawyer as their fellow citizens. The provision in question contradicts the principle of equal treatment and should be considered as <i>de jure</i> abolished without any prior judicial decision or legislative act for its abolishment.
Key issues (concepts, interpretations) clarified by the case (max. 500 chars)	The ethnic origin can not be a prerequisite for the exercise of the profession of lawyer.
Results (sanctions) and key consequences or implications of the case (max. 500 chars)	The complainant was appointed as a lawyer with a six month delay after her successful participation in the professional license examination in May 2006.

Case title	Foreign born naturalized Greek – employment as teaching staff
Decision date	2007 (complaint no. 7500/2006)
Reference details (type and title of court/body; in original language and English [official translation, if available])	Συνήγορος του Πολίτη, Φορέας Προώθησης της Αρχής της Ίσης Μεταχείρισης [Greek Ombudsman, National Equality Body]
Key facts of the case (max. 500 chars)	A Greek naturalised citizen applied for employment at the Non Commissioned Officers School of the Hellenic Army as a member of the teaching staff with an hourly remuneration contract. She was disqualified on grounds of not being a Greek citizen by birth, a necessary precondition according to the post advertisement.
Main reasoning/argumentation (max. 500 chars)	The precondition to be a Greek citizen by birth is questionable since rendering the lack of Greek ethnic origin (foreign born) –which is presumed by the acquisition of the Greek citizenship through naturalisation – a criterion allowing for a different treatment regarding the access to employment and occupation, contradicts the equality of Greek citizens proclaimed in the Constitution (Article 4, paragraph 1) on the one hand and the special provisions of Law 3304/2005 on the other.
Key issues (concepts, interpretations) clarified by the case (max. 500 chars)	The exception of citizenship from the application of antidiscrimination legislation (Law 3304/2005, Article 4, paragraph 2) does not apply to the foreign born naturalised Greek.
Results (sanctions) and key consequences or implications of the case (max. 500 chars)	The Greek Ombudsman asked the case to be re-examined by the Administration.

Case title	Alien instructor – dismissal
Decision date	2007 (complaint no. 19747/2005)
Reference details (type and title of court/body; in original language and English [official translation, if available])	Συνήγορος του Πολίτη, Φορέας Προώθησης της Αρχής της Ίσης Μεταχείρισης [Greek Ombudsman, National Equality Body]
Key facts of the case (max. 500 chars)	A female alien instructor working at an hourly remuneration at a Musical High School, who had been offered a post as having the necessary qualifications for it, was later dismissed for not holding the Greek citizenship. The Ministry of Education concluded that the employment of associate members of staff is not governed by the provisions for employment of teaching staff.
Main reasoning/argumentation (max. 500 chars)	The Greek citizenship is not a prerequisite for employment as a specialized associate member of staff (“scientific collaborator”) if there were no other Greek candidates for the post (violin instructor). The necessary qualifications for her employment had been checked at the time of application as well as of employment offer.
Key issues (concepts, interpretations) clarified by the case (max. 500 chars)	‘Citizenship exemption’
Results (sanctions) and key consequences or implications of the case (max. 500 chars)	The complainant sought recourse against the aforementioned decision which led to the suspension of her dismissal by the Regional Directorate of Primary and Secondary Education of Peloponese, Directorate of Arcadia. The final court decision is pending and thus the GO cannot proceed with the mediation procedure.

Case title	Aliens of Greek ethnic origin – Special provisions for admission to higher education institutions
Decision date	2007 (complaints nos. 16371/2005, 4539/2006, 5314/2006, 9444/2006)
Reference details (type and title of court/body; in original language and English [official translation, if available])	Συνήγορος του Πολίτη, Φορέας Προώθησης της Αρχής της Ίσης Μεταχείρισης [Greek Ombudsman, National Equality Body]
Key facts of the case (max. 500 chars)	According to the legislation in force (Law 3404/2005, Article 13, paragraph 3, section a and relative ministerial decision n. F151/1704/B6/17.2.2006) students of Greek origin studying in EU member states are exempt from the special provisions pertaining to the admission of EU citizens in higher education institutions and fall necessarily under the special provisions for expatriates.
Main reasoning/argumentation (max. 500 chars)	Discrimination against EU citizens on the grounds of their Greek origin comes into conflict with the provisions of Law 3304/2005, since the aforementioned exemption constitutes a direct discrimination on the grounds of ethnic origin.
Key issues (concepts, interpretations) clarified by the case (max. 500 chars)	Discrimination between the EU citizens.
Results (sanctions) and key consequences or implications of the case (max. 500 chars)	The GO suggested that the EU candidate assessment system should be rationalised by establishing, for instance, a coefficient for the knowledge of the Greek language whether this is the language of habitual use of each candidate or not; nevertheless, the GO emphasized the need to refrain from any reference or taking into account the ethnic origin of EU candidates.

Case title	Living conditions of Roma (Athens, Votanikos area)
Decision date	2007 (complaint no. 13986/2006)
Reference details (type and title of court/body; in original language and English [official translation, if available])	Συνήγορος του Πολίτη, Φορέας Προώθησης της Αρχής της Ίσης Μεταχείρισης [Greek Ombudsman, National Equality Body]
Key facts of the case (max. 500 chars)	Upon rising of the issue of the potential compulsory relocation of Roma from the settlement of Votanikos area (Athens) in the mass media, as well within the organizations engaged in the matter, the Greek Ombudsman visited the settlement and proceeded with a series of actions in order to mobilise the competent services.
Main reasoning/argumentation (max. 500 chars)	The aim of these actions was to ensure adequate living conditions for this vulnerable population and to prevent the possibility of the compulsory evacuation of this plot of land without the guarantees stemming from the Constitution and the legislation in force.
Key issues (concepts, interpretations) clarified by the case (max. 500 chars)	The particularities of the Roma people and the special conditions under which they live are contradictory to the principle of equal treatment.
Results (sanctions) and key consequences or implications of the case (max. 500 chars)	The response of the Municipality of Athens is pending; special care should be taken and a suitable plot of land with appropriate living conditions should be indicated for the possible relocation of the Roma. Then, the competent Region General Secretary should take a relevant decision in collaboration with the competent Directorate of the Ministry of the Interior

Case title	Living conditions of the Roma – neighbours’ reactions (isle of Lefkada)
Decision date	2007 (complaints no. 13770/2006)
Reference details (type and title of court/body; in original language and English [official translation, if available])	Συνήγορος του Πολίτη, Φορέας Προώθησης της Αρχής της Ίσης Μεταχείρισης [Greek Ombudsman, National Equality Body]
Key facts of the case (max. 500 chars)	Roma settled permanently in their shafts on a plot of land owned by a Roma relative and lacking basic facilities such as toilets, drainage, and electricity supply. This caused inappropriate health conditions and infections, affecting the settlers as well as their neighbours. In addition, due to the lack of electricity supply, the Roma were obliged to use a generator for long hours causing noise that disturbed their neighbours.
Main reasoning/argumentation (max. 500 chars)	Need for improvement of the living conditions of the Roma according to the legislation in force “for the settlement of wandering people” (ministerial decision B- 973/2003, amending the sanitary regulation A5/696/83).
Key issues (concepts, interpretations) clarified by the case (max. 500 chars)	Roma settlements and relevant health conditions are covered under the antidiscrimination legislation.
Results (sanctions) and key consequences or implications of the case (max. 500 chars)	The GO addressed the Municipality and the competent Departments of the Prefecture of Lefkada, stressing the compelling need for improvement of the living conditions of the Roma.

Case title	Living conditions of the Roma – neighbours’ reactions (isle of Lefkada)
Decision date	2007 (complaints no. 2864/2006)
Reference details (type and title of court/body; in original language and English [official translation, if available])	Συνήγορος του Πολίτη, Φορέας Προώθησης της Αρχής της Ίσης Μεταχείρισης [Greek Ombudsman, National Equality Body]
Key facts of the case (max. 500 chars)	Residents of the Apolpaina hamlet in Lefkada filed a complaint to the GO for the settlement of Roma in makeshift shacks and other structures (tents, toilets built with cement blocks) within the restricted-build area of the Holy Temple of Panaghia Hodegetria, a listed historical monument itself, and for the poor sanitary conditions on this plot. The competent Ephorate of Byzantine Antiquities of the Ministry of Culture, following an on-spot investigation, recommended to the Mayor of Lefkada to remove the Roma from the site.
Main reasoning/argumentation (max. 500 chars)	Need for improvement of the living conditions of Roma according to the legislation in force “for the settlement of wandering people” (ministerial decision B- 973/2003, amending the sanitary regulation A5/696/83).
Key issues (concepts, interpretations) clarified by the case (max. 500 chars)	Roma settlements and relevant health conditions are covered under the antidiscrimination legislation.
Results (sanctions) and key consequences or implications of the case (max. 500 chars)	The GO undertook the role of the mediator with a twofold aim: to preserve the area of the historical monument and to ensure that the local authorities offer to the Roma special support as a group facing social exclusion.

Case title	Real estate acquisitions by Roma
Decision date	2007 (complaints nos. 1956/2006 & 11255/2006)
Reference details (type and title of court/body; in original language and English [official translation, if available])	Συνήγορος του Πολίτη, Φορέας Προώθησης της Αρχής της Ίσης Μεταχείρισης [Greek Ombudsman, National Equality Body]
Key facts of the case (max. 500 chars)	A delay to issue a Real Estate Tax receipt from the Municipality of Ano Liossia, which also included the accusation that this constitutes common dilatory tactics on behalf of the Municipality in order to discourage owners to sell their properties to Roma.
Main reasoning/argumentation (max. 500 chars)	The dilatory tactics on behalf of the Municipality in order to discourage owners to sell their properties to Roma is prohibited by the antidiscrimination law 3304/2005.
Key issues (concepts, interpretations) clarified by the case (max. 500 chars)	Clarifying the concept of “the access to and supply of goods and services which are available to the public, including housing”.
Results (sanctions) and key consequences or implications of the case (max. 500 chars)	The payment receipts were issued following intervention by the GO.

Case title	Perlala vs Greece
Decision date	22.02.2007
Reference details (type and title of court/body; in original language and English [official translation, if available])	European Court of Human Rights
Key facts of the case (max. 500 chars)	The applicant, an Albanian, suspected of having thrown Molotov cocktails during a demonstration against the Greek educational system in 1999, was prosecuted and given a suspended sentence to imprisonment. The applicant appealed on points of law, but the Court of Cassation dismissed his appeal in 2003 without examining the ground of appeal based on Article 6.
Main reasoning/argumentation (max. 500 chars)	The criterion applied by the Court of Cassation for the dismissal of the appeal was a formalistic one.
Key issues (concepts, interpretations) clarified by the case (max. 500 chars)	The Court rejected his complaint for discrimination (Article 14) because Perlala hadn't referred to before the Greek courts (non exhaustion of domestic remedies).
Results (sanctions) and key consequences or implications of the case (max. 500 chars)	The ECHR concluded, unanimously, that there had been a violation of Article 6 §§ 1 and 3, and awarded the applicant 6,000 € for non-pecuniary damage.

Case title	Zelilof v. Greece
Decision date	03.05.2007
Reference details (type and title of court/body; in original language and English [official translation, if available])	European Court of Human Rights
Key facts of the case (max. 500 chars)	Ill-treatment of the applicant, a Russian-Pontiac origin, by the police and the ineffective investigation into his ill-treatment.
Main reasoning/argumentation (max. 500 chars)	The Court considers that whilst the police officers' conduct during the applicant's arrest calls for serious criticism, that behaviour is not of itself a sufficient basis for concluding that the treatment inflicted on the applicant by the police was racially motivated.
Key issues (concepts, interpretations) clarified by the case (max. 500 chars)	The Court reiterates that in assessing evidence it has adopted the standard of proof “beyond reasonable doubt”; nonetheless, it has not excluded the possibility that in certain cases of alleged discrimination it may require the respondent Government to disprove an arguable allegation of discrimination and – if they fail to do so – find a violation of the prohibition of discrimination (Article 14 ECHR) on that basis.
Results (sanctions) and key consequences or implications of the case (max. 500 chars)	The European Court of Human Rights held unanimously that there had been a violation of Article 3 (prohibition of inhuman or degrading treatment) and awarded the applicant the sum of 20,000 € for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses.

Case title	Karagiannopoulos vs Greece
Decision date	21.06.2007
Reference details (type and title of court/body; in original language and English [official translation, if available])	European Court of Human Rights
Key facts of the case (max. 500 chars)	A police officer shot then 17-year old Rom Ioannis Karagiannopoulos who has since remained 100% invalid.
Main reasoning/argumentation (max. 500 chars)	The applicant alleged that one of the police officers who had taken part in the operation had stated before the criminal court that “the majority of gypsies are criminals”. The Court considered that, while their trivialisation meant that the statements made by a witness during the trial were clearly insulting for persons of Roma origin and were thus unacceptable, there had been no violation of the prohibition of discrimination (Article 14 ECHR) together with the right to life (Article 2).
Key issues (concepts, interpretations) clarified by the case (max. 500 chars)	The Court justified the non violation of the prohibition of discrimination by saying that nor the applicant neither the NGOs had alerted the Greek tribunal for the racially motivated act on the part of the authorities.
Results (sanctions) and key consequences or implications of the case (max. 500 chars)	The European Court of Human Rights held unanimously that there had been a violation of Article 2 (right to life) and awarded the applicant the sum of 120,000 euros for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage.

Case title	Celniku vs Greece
Decision date	05.07.2007
Reference details (type and title of court/body; in original language and English [official translation, if available])	European Court of Human Rights
Key facts of the case (max. 500 chars)	The ECHR case concerned the case of the death of and Albanian immigrant during a police control by the gun of a police officer in 2001. The organisation of the police operation in which the applicants' brother died; a violation of Article 2 on account of shortcomings in the inquiry into the death of the applicants' brother.
Main reasoning/argumentation (max. 500 chars)	The Court did not consider it established "beyond reasonable doubt" that the actions of the State agents in the instant case had been motivated by racial prejudice against persons of Albanian origin. It therefore declared the complaint under Article 14 inadmissible as being manifestly ill-founded.
Key issues (concepts, interpretations) clarified by the case (max. 500 chars)	The Court adopts the standard of proof "beyond reasonable doubt" but adds that such proof may follow from the coexistence of sufficiently strong, clear and concordant inferences or of similar irrebuttable presumptions of fact.
Results (sanctions) and key consequences or implications of the case (max. 500 chars)	Under Article 41 (just satisfaction) of the Convention, the Court awarded the applicants jointly 4,010 euros (EUR) for pecuniary damage, EUR 20,000 for non-pecuniary damage and EUR 5,000 for costs and expenses.

Case title	Bekir-Ousta and Others v. Greece
Decision date	11.10.2007
Reference details (type and title of court/body; in original language and English [official translation, if available])	European Court of Human Rights
Key facts of the case (max. 500 chars)	In 1996 a Greek court rejected an application to have a non-profit-making association called the “Evros Prefecture Minority Youth Association registered, with the argument that the Treaty of Lausanne recognised only a Muslim, and not a Turkish minority in Western Thrace, that the title of the association was confusing and was not aimed at serving the interests of the Muslim minority in Evros.
Main reasoning/argumentation (max. 500 chars)	The European Court of Human Rights among others observed that even assuming that the true aim of the association had been to promote the idea that an ethnic minority existed in Greece, that did not amount to a threat to a democratic society.
Key issues (concepts, interpretations) clarified by the case (max. 500 chars)	The promotion of an ethnic minority is not a threat to a democratic society and is not illegal.
Results (sanctions) and key consequences or implications of the case (max. 500 chars)	The Court held unanimously that there had been a violation of Article 11 ECHR.

Annex 2d – Criminal court cases

Case title	Albanian workers.
Decision date	22.05.07
Reference details (type and title of court/body; in original language and English [official translation, if available])	Εφετείο Αθηνών. [Thessalonica Court of Appeal]
Key facts of the case (max. 500 chars)	The murder of the three Albanian workers in 1995 and 1996.
Main reasoning/argumentation (max. 500 chars)	No racist motivation has been taken into account
Key issues (concepts, interpretations) clarified by the case (max. 500 chars)	
Results (sanctions) and key consequences or implications of the case (max. 500 chars)	The Thessalonica Court of Appeal confirmed first degree sentence (four times life imprisonment) to the murderer.

Annex 4 – Racist violence and Crime

Table 1 - Unofficial data on major violent incidents against immigrants and minorities (2003-2007)

	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007 ²⁴⁷
<i>Major racist violence incidents</i>					
against immigrants and refugees	5	11	12	16	27
against Roma	2	3	3	2	3
against religious minorities	-	2	1	3	3
alleged police, border & costal guard racist violence incidents (included above)	4	4	9	7	8
Violence against immigrants - death toll	1 ²⁴⁸	1 ²⁴⁹	1 ²⁵⁰	2 ²⁵¹	4 ²⁵²

Source: HLHR-KEMO Annual Report (2007), Pavlou Miltos, *Racism and Discrimination against Immigrants and Minorities: the state of play.*
www.hlhr.gr/hlhr-kemo/docs/HLHR-KEMO%20AR2007.pdf

Data for the period 2003-2006 are calculated on the basis of incidents recorded and reported by the NFP 'Antigone' RAXEN National Annual Reports 2003, 2004, 2005 and 2006.

The original unofficial sources of the data of the above table are the multiple media and NGO reports whose relevance, validity and reliability is verified by the RAXEN NFP.

Table 2 – Trafficking –Cases, perpetrators, victims (2003-2006)

	2003	2004	2005	2006
Cases	49	65	60	70
Perpetrators	284	288	202	206
Victims	93	181	137	83

Source: Ministry of Public Order, available at:
<http://www.ydt.gr/main/Section.jsp?SectionID=13441>

²⁴⁷ As of 28.10.2007.

²⁴⁸ Nigerian male immigrant.

²⁴⁹ Albanian male immigrant.

²⁵⁰ Albanian male immigrant.

²⁵¹ Albanian and Georgian male immigrants.

²⁵² Two Albanians, one Nigerian, one Georgian, all male immigrants. Two among the reported victims are killed during and intra-group clash of Albanians and Georgians in Thessaloniki on May 2007. The Nigerian's death was allegedly caused by his chase by police officers, from whom he had allegedly suffered ill-treatment some days before.

Annex 5 – Employment

Table 1 - Labour Inspection Body on cases of illegal employment of immigrant workers in 2007

SEPE regional offices	court proceedings	finest imposed
Athens	4	1
Peloponessus	3	
East Attica	1	
East Macedonia-Thrace		
North Aegean		
West Attica		
TOTAL	8	1

Source: SEPE 10.2007

Table 2- Valid residence permits and regularisation program data on 31.08.2007

Valid permits for Self-employment	1.517
Valid permits for Provision of services	13.512
Valid permits for Dependant employment	265.285
Valid permits for Seasonal employment	5.442
<i>Total valid residence permits for employment puposes</i>	<i>285.756</i>
<i>Total valid residence permits for all purposes</i>	<i>473.547</i>
<i>Total of regularisation program applications (par.10 & 11 of art.90 of the law n.3386/2005)</i>	<i>152.400</i>

Source: Ministry of Interior, Public Administration and Decentralisation

Table 3 - Insured workers per nationality and industry - 2007

ΙΟΥΛΙΟΣ 2006 / JULY 2006
ΠΙΝΑΚΑΣ 5 : ΚΟΙΝΕΣ ΕΠΙΧΕΙΡΗΣΕΙΣ ΚΑΙ ΟΙΚΟΔΟΜΟΤΕΧΝΙΚΑ ΕΡΓΑ
ΚΑΤΑΝΟΜΗ ΑΣΦΑΛΙΣΜΕΝΩΝ* ΑΝΑ ΟΙΚΟΝΟΜΙΚΗ ΔΡΑΣΤΗΡΙΟΤΗΤΑ ΚΑΙ ΥΠΗΚΟΟΤΗΤΑ
TABLE 5 : ENTERPRISES & CONSTRUCTIONS
DISTRIBUTION OF INSURED POPULATION BY ECONOMIC ACTIVITY & NATIONALITY

Οικονομική δραστηριότητα	Ελλάδα Greece	%	Χώρας Ε.Ε. (24) EU (24) countries	%	Αλβανία Albania	%	Υπόλοιποι Others	%	Σύνολο Total	%	Εκτιμώμενη οικονομική δραστηριότητα
Γεωργία, κτηνοτροφία, θήρα και α.β.δ.	5.838	0,35	21	0,12	506	0,41	318	0,28	6.783	0,34	A
Αλιεία	2.214	0,13	17	0,10	66	0,06	114	0,10	2.431	0,12	B
Ορυχεία και λατομεία	7.971	0,47	40	0,23	321	0,26	275	0,24	8.607	0,44	C
Μεταποιητικές βιομηχανίες	320.176	18,97	1.408	8,26	21.410	14,38	25.219	22,23	365.213	18,72	D
Παροχή ηλεκτρισμού, φυσικού αερίου και νερού	16.941	1,00	6	0,04	92	0,06	60	0,05	17.099	0,87	E
Κατασκευές	172.839	10,24	1.960	11,49	69.444	46,63	25.709	22,66	269.952	13,72	ΣΤ
Χονδρικό και λιανικό εμπόριο	383.446	22,72	2.186	12,82	17.227	11,57	15.315	13,50	418.176	21,26	Z
Ενοίκια και εστιατόρια	170.376	10,10	5.598	32,82	24.147	16,22	20.485	16,05	220.606	11,21	H
Μεταφορές, αποθήκευση και επικοινωνίες	128.655	7,64	1.388	8,14	2.137	1,44	2.476	2,18	134.656	6,86	Θ
Ενοίκια, χρηματοπιστωτικοί οργανισμοί	55.519	3,29	300	1,76	182	0,12	203	0,18	56.204	2,86	I
Διαχείριση ακίνητης περιουσίας	122.739	7,27	1.884	11,05	5.166	3,47	5.381	4,74	135.170	6,87	K
Δημόσια διοίκηση και αμυνα	71.450	4,23	64	0,38	162	0,11	108	0,10	71.754	3,65	A
Επισκευές	35.448	2,15	563	3,30	355	0,24	400	0,35	37.766	1,92	M
ΥΓΕΙΑ και κοινωνική πρόνοια	75.148	4,45	582	3,34	1.053	0,71	503	0,50	77.588	3,94	N
Άλλες δραστηριότητες	100.168	5,84	657	3,85	3.236	2,17	2.577	2,27	106.638	5,42	Ξ
Ιδιωτικά νοσοκομεία	5.751	0,34	286	1,68	2.647	1,78	13.159	11,60	21.843	1,11	O
Επιδρομικοί οργανισμοί	1.218	0,07	65	0,38	9	0,01	64	0,05	1.356	0,07	Π
Άγνωστο	10.573	0,63	110	0,64	630	0,42	673	0,59	11.986	0,61	Άγνωστο
Σύνολο	1.687.864	100,00	17.055	100,00	148.310	100,00	113.441	100,00	1.967.070	100,00	Total

* Ο αριθμός των ασφαλισμένων είναι διαφορετικός

ΠΑΡΑΤΗΡΗΣΕΙΣ ΣΕ ΠΡΟΣ ΤΗΝ ΟΙΚΟΝΟΜΙΚΗ ΔΡΑΣΤΗΡΙΟΤΗΤΑ ΕΡΓΟΔΟΤΗ

1. Στο σύνολο των ασφαλισμένων απασχολούνται στο χονδρικό & λιαν. εμπόριο 21,26%, στις μεταποιητικές 18,72%.
2. Οι Έλληνες απασχολούνται στο χονδρικό & λιανικό εμπόριο 22,72%, στις μεταποιητικές 18,97%.
3. Οι Υπόλοιποι των άλλων χωρών της Ε.Ε. απασχολούνται στα Ενοίκια και εστιατόρια 32,82% και στο χονδρικό και λιανικό εμπόριο 12,82%.
4. Οι Αλβανοί απασχολούνται στις κατασκευές 46,63% και στα Ενοίκια και εστιατόρια 16,22%.
5. Οι Υπόλοιποι απασχολούνται στις κατασκευές 22,66% και στις μεταποιητικές 22,23%.

COMMENTS ON EMPLOYER'S ECONOMIC ACTIVITY

- 1) 21,26% of insured population is employed in 'Wholesale & retail trade' and 18,72% in 'Manufacturing'
- 2) 22,72% of insured Greeks is employed in 'Wholesale & retail trade' and 18,97% in 'Manufacturing'
- 3) 32,82% of insured EU citizens is employed in 'Hotels and restaurants' and 12,82% in 'Wholesale & retail trade'
- 4) 46,63% of insured Albanians is employed in 'Constructions' and 16,22% in 'Hotels and restaurants'
- 5) 22,66% of the insured foreigner workers is employed in 'Constructions' and 22,23% in 'Manufacturing'

Source: IKA bulletin June 2007

Table 4 - Ethnic discrimination in employment and wage gap in the Geek Labour market – original research tables of a survey performed in Greece in 2006-2007

Source: Nick Drydakís Minas Vlassis, *Ethnic Discrimination in the Greek Labour Market: Occupational Access, Insurance Coverage, and Wage Offers*, University of Crete Working Paper (2007).

Time and location: May 2006 to January 2007, Athens

Methodology: Correspondence Test - technique of written approaches for interview access to advertised vacancies measuring occupational access for Greek and Albanian workers.

Sample: 789 advertised vacancies for office jobs, factory jobs, café and restaurant services and shop sales.

Table 1 Invitation to Interviews - Probability Results (%) -

Outcomes	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
Occupations	P_{N_I}	P_{U_I}	P_{E_I}	P_{DA_I}	P_{DG_I}	P_{ND_I}	χ^2 test
Job Opening							
Office Jobs 173	42.77	57.22	30.30	67.67	2.020	65.65	61.23*
Factories 217	59.44	40.55	53.40	43.18	3.409	39.77	29.87*
Restaurant and Café Services 241	48.54	51.45	67.74	28.22	4.032	24.19	22.50*
Shop Sales 158	51.26	48.73	41.55	54.54	3.896	50.64	33.80*
Total 789	50.82	49.17	49.74	46.90	3.350	43.55	146.46*

Note: Statistically significant at 1% (*).

Table 2 Insurance Coverage Registrations - Probability Results (%) -

Outcomes	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Occupations	P_{N_B}	P_{R_B}	P_{U_B}	P_{E_B}	P_{DA_B}	P_{DG_B}	P_{ND_B}	χ^2 Test
Stage's One Equal Treatment Outcome								
Office Jobs 30	36.66	23.33	40.00	83.33	16.66	0	16.66	2
Factories 47	19.14	8.510	72.34	73.52	26.47	0	26.47	9**
Restaurant and Café Services 84	48.80	22.61	28.57	45.83	54.16	0	54.16	13*
Shop Sales 32	37.50	25.00	37.50	50.00	50.00	0	50.00	6**
Total 193	37.82	19.68	42.48	63.41	36.58	0	36.58	30*

Note: Statistically significant at 1% (*), statistically significant at 5% (**).

Table 3. Employers Wage Offers (€) – Discrimination Coefficient –

Wage Measures	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
	Greek Mean Wage	Albanian Mean Wage	Difference in Ethnic Mean Wages	Discrimination Coefficient (%)	ANOVA F – statistic
Observations	\bar{W}_G	\bar{W}_A	$\bar{W}_G - \bar{W}_A$	$d = (\bar{W}_G - \bar{W}_A) / \bar{W}_G$	
Office Jobs 16	716.87	629.37	87.50	$d = 12.20$	13.35*
Factories 23	673.91	607.39	66.52	$d = 9.870$	12.00*
Restaurant and Café Services 38	599.21	562.89	36.31	$d = 6.060$	6.086*
Shop Sales 17	618.82	557.00	61.82	$d = 9.990$	3.958*
Total 94	641.06	584.04	57.02	$d = 8.890$	24.55*

Note: Statistically Significant at 1 %(*).

Table 4. Minimum Wages (€) for Unmarried Employees & Workers as defined by the N.G.C.E.A.

Periods	Work Experiences	No Experience	Three Year Experiences	Six Year Experiences	Nine Year Experiences
I. January to September 2006		608.32	659.00	718.91	778.82
II. September 2006 to May 2007		625.97	678.11	739.76	801.41
Average I & II		617.14	668.55	729.33	790.11

Annex 6 - Education

**Table 1 - Foreign and repatriated pupils in Greek public schools
School year 2006-2007**

Education grade	Pupils	Foreign	Repatriated
Elementary school	581,336	54,322	7,119
Secondary school (Gymnasium – Highschool - vocational training)	614,075	47,073	13,034
Total	1,195,411	101,395	20,153

Source: IPODE - Institute for the Greek Diaspora Education and Intercultural Studies

**Table 2 - Education of Migrant and Repatriated Programme
School year 2006-2007**

	Number of schools	Number of classes	Number of pupils (directly involved)	Number of beneficiaries (Pupils)	Number of educators (directly involved)	Number of beneficiaries (Educators)
Elementary School	582	1,571	8,907	62,410	614	5,797
Secondary school		148	1,831			1,351

Source: IPODE - Institute for the Greek Diaspora Education and Intercultural Studies

**Table 3 - Roma pupils in Greek public schools
School year 2006-2007**

Enrolled children	6614
Drop-outs	1565

Source: IPODE - Institute for the Greek Diaspora Education and Intercultural Studies

**Table 4 - Thracian Muslim Minority Pupils
School year 2006-07**

	Boys	Girls	Total
Minority Primary Schools	3,474	3,263	6,737
Minority Gymnasiums	531	473	1,004
Minority Lyceums	232	186	418
Public Gymnasiums	1,517	1,115	2,632
Public Lyceums	970	729	1,699

Source: IPODE - Institute for the Greek Diaspora Education and Intercultural Studies

**Table 5A - Thracian Muslim Minority students in Greek Universities
(Highschool Graduates)**

	Slots	Candidates	Success	Dropouts	Vacant slots remained
School year 2006-07	503	493	374	119	129
School year 2007-08	513	479	367	112	146

**Table 5B - Thracian Muslim Minority students in Greek Universities
(Vocational training Graduates)**

	Slots	Candidates	Success	Dropouts	Vacant slots remained
School year 2006-07	227	125	96	29	131
School year 2007-08	243	162	120	42	127

Source: IPODE - Institute for the Greek Diaspora Education and Intercultural Studies

Annex 7 - Housing

Table 1 - Distribution of Roma housing loans per region (applications 2006, processed in 2006-2007)

REGION	New applications	Total loans (distribution 2006)	application for assessment	APPROVALS	CORRESPONDENCE	REJECTIONS
ATTICA	3309	340	457	87	32	7
EASTERN MACEDONIA & THRACE	2408	270	234	19	24	1
WESTERN GREECE	2198	229	225	26	35	3
WESTERN MACEDONIA	10	5	10	0	0	0
EPIRUS	51	6	9	0	0	0
THESSALY	2869	338	395	92	69	6
IONIAN ISLANDS	34	5	8	0	8	0
CENTRAL MACEDONIA	2311	238	273	86	73	4
CRETE	293	147	156	139	7	7
SOUTH AEGEAN	41	5	10	2	8	0
PELOPONNESUS	1210	126	204	46	14	6
CENTRAL GREECE	918	126	98	19	10	4
GRAND TOTAL	15652	1835	2079	516	280	38

Source: General Directorate of Development Programs of the Ministry of Interior doc.n. 53949 and 53546/23.10.2007

Annex 8 – Health & Social Care

[195]. Not available.